another school. Competition is worst when there are two or more schools clustered in the same area. Switching schools, sometimes because families move from one camp to another, makes it difficult to determine actual enrollment figures and to estimate the need for books and stationary.

B. Commissionerate Schools

The Commissionerate has Education Cells in Quetta and Peshawar that manage their schools. Refugee education in the Punjab is handled from the Quetta office. The Education Cells hire both Pakistani and Afghan teachers. Camp leaders and political parties are involved in teacher selection. The Education Cells try to hire twelfth grade graduates but cannot always confirm that a recommended candidate has graduated from secondary school. Many Afghans fled without taking certificates. A test was initiated in 1985 because they found that they sometimes ending up hiring illiterate or semi-literate teachers. In practice, however, Education Cell staff find they must take a somewhat flexible approach to testing, particularly for finding Afghan teachers. The test, for example, covers materials presented in CAR schools through the fifth grade.

In NWFP, the Education Cell of the Commissionerate is directing 472 primary schools for refugees. In addition, there are 145 middle schools that begin with first grade, and two or three secondary schools that admit 5th and 6th grade students. Seventy-six of these schools are girls' schools with a total enrollment of 7,168 students. Enrollment in the primary grades of the boys' schools totals around 94,427. One third of the teachers are Pakistani (1002) and two-thirds Afghan (2012). Roughly two-thirds of the female teachers are Pakistani.

In Baluchistan, the Education Cell has set up 100 primary schools and 45 middle schools. Twelve of the primary schools are girls' schools, with a total enrollment of 666. Enrollment in the boys' primary and middle schools is 13,986. Seven schools operate in the Dari language while all the rest are Pushto-medium. The Commissionerate does not currently have Dari-language materials, but the Experiment in International Living is translating CAR Pushto-language textbooks. There are 480 teachers, only seven of whom are Pakistani.

For 1989, since the rate of refugee return is uncertain, UNHCR is planning to support schools on the same level as this year. This will presumably include funding for a number of NGOs providing teacher training.

C. Tanzeem Schools

All the parties have education departments which are responsible for organizing and managing schools. Discussions were not held with these departments since this was outside the consultant's terms of reference. The larger parties, such as Jamiyat and Hizb-e-Islami (Hikmatyar) have more schools than the other, smaller parties such as Jebha. They support both religious and secular schools, although religion is an important component of the program in the latter. One party, that of Khalis, supports mostly religious schools and has only a few secular ones. Virtually all the seven parties of the Alliance get support from various NGOs for some of their refugee schools. This support ranges from complete funding of a school (more likely in Peshawar and environs than elsewhere) to provision of books and supplies. Some teacher training is offered and is discussed in a following section.

D. Private Schools

There are private schools run by Afghans, often in the cities and towns where middle class Afghans are found. Sometimes these are supported by NGOs. There are also schools that are run directly by NGOs. Most of these schools are in NWFP where the majority of NGOs are based. Those schools directed by NGOs are as follows:

- Swiss Afghan Project Association - 7 schools with 1710 students in grades one through three. There are three separate classes for girls, and some other classes are mixed.

- Muslim Aid - 17 schools with 2479 students in grades one through six. Five of these are affiliated and managed by Jamiyat-e-Islami. Seven are girls schools, one of which includes a high school section. In addition, 200 Quranic pre-schools, primarily for girls, have been set up. These offer a two year program in religious education.

- Islamic Relief Agency (ISRA) - 11 schools with 4075 students in grades one through six. Six of these are girls' schools. More than half these students are male orphans attending four ISRA schools outside of Peshawar. One boys' school is in Quetta, while the rest are in NWFP. An additional 1500 children, 1000 of whom are girls, are enrolled in Quranic centers, in which reading and writing in Pushto is taught in addition to the more usual religious subjects.

- International Rescue Committee - 16 first grade classes, with funding available for an additional 59, which are scheduled to be set up. These classes are held in private

TABLE IV.1

SUMMARY OF NGO-SUPPORTED EFFORTS IN AFGHANISTAN

	Number of Schools	Number of Teachers	Number of Students
AEC	375	1783	56478
ECA/UNO*	636		86933
MUSLIM AID	271	899	29753
ISRA	18	76	3390
NCA	42	123	3126
MSF**	54	91	
AFRANE***	80		
SOLIDARITE AFGHANISTAN****	13		1900
GAF	1	2	75
TOTAL	1490	2974	181655

*For ECA schools, the number given is the number of schools verified by monitors. The ECA has sent books and supplies to 1610 schools but monitoring visits are still underway to some of these schools.

**Number of teachers in 21 of the 54 schools.

***24 schools in Logar are jointly supported by Afrane and Solidarite Afghanistan.

****These are only the schools in Wardak. Solidarite expects to be supporting schools in Herat in the near future.

homes and are meant primarily to accomodate girls.

- British Pakistan Model School and Teacher Training Program - one model school in Quetta with classes through the fourth grade. Thirty children are currently enrolled but this figure will increase to seventy by next March. Fifth and Sixth grade classes will open in January 1989.

- Save the Children (U.S.) - This group is not involved in formal primary education but has recently started a youth literacy program for about 450 children, ages 10-14.

In addition, the IRC supports 68 tanzeem schools in NWFP with books and supplies. It supplies books, materials and salaries to five other party schools in Peshawar district. The AEC and the Norwegian Committee each support two refugee schools in NWFP managed by others. There are also other organizations involved in supporting refugee schools but not in teacher training. These include the Saudi Red Crescent, Kuwaiti Red Cresent, and Inter Church Aid.

NGO support for primary education for refugees is useful but still quite small given the need.

IV. NGO ACTIVITIES IN AFGHANISTAN

A. The Organization of NGO Operations

The three organizations with the largest cross-border programs are the Afghanistan Education Committee (AEC) with 357 schools; the Education Center for Afghanistan/University of Nebraska at Omaha (ECA/UNO) with 636 schools verified by monitors as of the end of October but possibly 900-1000 extant; and Muslim Aid with 271 schools. The AEC and Muslim Aid function independently of the Peshawar-based Alliance and member parties. They maintain good relations with individual parties, however, and seek to keep party education staff informed about their assistance. The ECA/UNO project, on the other hand, is implemented directly by the Alliance's Education Center and receives funding from U.S.A.I.D. through the University of Nebraska at Omaha (UNO), which is the Office of the AID Representative's contractor for the Education Sector Support Project. UNO is mandated not only to support primary education in Afghanistan but also to strengthen the Alliance's capacity to initiate and manage activies in this sector. In addition, the Norwegian Committee for Afghanistan supports 42 schools in Ghazni province. Other NGOs working in other sectors, such as agriculture, support smaller numbers of schools in areas where they provide their main form of assistance. Table IV.1 summarizes NGO support for primary schools.

It is useful to contrast how the three larger organizations work. The AEC works through a designated community representative or education supervisor named usually by the commander of the area. The supervisor or another representative comes at periodic intervals to Peshawar to deliver reports, and pick up salaries, books and supplies. Before setting up a program of schools in an area, the AEC does careful checking and extensive interviewing, both to determine the honesty of the leader of the area and to assess school needs. Generally, a package of books, supplies and salaries is given for three classes of forty students each for a three month period. For more remote areas in the north, a package for six months is sometimes given. Monitors are sent to check on the schools.

Muslim Aid relies entirely on its own staff of 75 individuals, who come and go inside of Afghanistan, to deliver books, supplies and salaries. It also sends its staff to identify sites for new schools and local leaders with whom Muslim Aid could work. It does not generally accept requests in Peshawar but prefers to be the initiator in identifying new sites. It manages some of its schools inside directly, while others are managed by a local leader. Staff are located in Quetta and there are permanent representatives based in X and Y which allows better monitoring in the north. This approach minimizes the potential for abuse, but it is more staff intensive. The administrative costs are higher.

The University of Nebraska at Omaha helped establish the Education Center for Afghanistan (ECA) about two years ago and has worked with Center staff to try to build the ECA into an institution undertaking a range of activities in primary education and literacy training. The first textbooks and supplies were sent to Afghanistan only 18 months ago so expansion has been rapid. The ECA has a staff of 54 in Peshawar and 24 in Quetta. In addition, there are 42 monitors divided into 14 teams of three each, and 191 district supervisors who are permanently based inside. The UNO has a staff of 20 in Peshawar, and uses short-term monitors to provide an additional check. This is a large staff compared to the other two groups, but a larger number of schools are being provided with support. The literacy program is also a major activity on the Pakistani side of the border, and requires considerable staff.

ECA staff, like those at the Afghanistan Education Committee, accept requests for school support from parties and commanders. They interview those making the requests and try to screen candidates. As a group made up of six of the tanzeems, it has sometimes been difficult for them to deny requests from party representatives or commanders, even those about whom they had doubts. This is why verification by monitors is required before schools can be approved to receive salary payments or re-supply.

Because this procedure can have its limitations, the ECA now also accepts recommendations from its monitors about the placement of new schools.

Community or education representatives are designated by the local commanders or leaders to receive school materials in Peshawar or Quetta. Books and supplies have been sent to 1,610 schools, which the ECA is in the process of monitoring. UNO staff estimate that roughly 900-1000 of these schools will be found to be operational. Salary payments are not made until monitors have confirmed the existence of the school. Under this system, losses are minimized and are confined to books and, more significantly, transportation money. No re-supply of schools is done until monitors have verified the schools.

The placement of district supervisors in areas with schools is a recent and interesting development. These have been hired, trained and placed in the field since last spring. While many are former teachers, not all have education experience. About two thirds of their work is administrative, such as keeping track of student and teacher attendance, while the remaining portion is used for on-site supervision of the teaching and in-service training. District supervisors are also be responsible for checking on the receipt of books, supplies and salaries. They also ensure that proper salary payments are made to teachers. The district supervisors themselves received two weeks of training, the final session of which finished in October.

B. Teachers

Those now teaching in liberated areas of Afghanistan do not appear to have qualifications that are in any way better than those teaching refugees. The one exception to this may be in those northern areas that traditionally valued education and that have not been so severely disturbed by the war. In general, many teaching now are new school-leavers or those who have changed profession. A former government clerk or army officer, for example, who is unable to obtain employment in his field and unwilling to work for the regime, may become a school teacher because he has some education. Data that the ECA/UNO project has collected on teachers in its schools indicates that one-third the teachers have less than a secondary school degree, and another 40% are high school graduates. Ten per cent graduated from religious institutes while only 10-13% have any post-secondary school education. Among headmasters, 25% have not finished high school, while roughly 24% have some sort of post-secondary qualifications. The AEC believes that the majority of the teachers in the schools it supports have less than a high school degree, while Muslim Aid staff think that the majority of their teachers are high school graduates. Qualifications differ from one province to another. In some provinces, it is very difficult

to find individuals with sufficient education to be employed as teachers. In others, it is relatively easy. Actually, the number of high school graduates suggested by the above seems high, given very limited secondary schooling opportunities before and since the war, but perhaps secondary graduates have very limited employment opportunities now.

C. Monitoring

In general, the monitoring conducted by these NGOs appears to be conscientious and as thorough as circumstances currently permit. Muslim Aid staff, for example, comment that one of the reasons the bulk of their schools are clustered in border provinces is the difficulty of arranging comprehensive monitoring of schools in areas more remote from Pakistan. The AEC, on the other hand, has been willing to risk the loss of some funds in order to reach more distant areas. One example drawn from current AEC experience highlights the difficulty of monitoring. The AEC supports some schools in Herat. Much earlier in the year, the reports from Herat were months overdue and when they arrived, they seemed somewhat suspect. Staff have been trying to find out since the spring if the schools exist and what condition they are in. Answers coming back from expatriate travellers or from one Afghan sent to the province have been inconclusive. Now another expatriate is travelling to Herat, and the AEC hopes that he will be able to provide a definitive answer. He will not be back until April so they must wait until then. So, in the end, it will take then over eight months to learn what is happening with these Herat schools and to make a decision about continued support.

The first concern of monitoring in such extremely difficult circumstances is to prove that schools have been set up and that books, supplies and salaries are distributed as intended. A secondary interest is the quality of the program and teaching. Monitoring activities are time-intensive, dangerous, expensive and often very difficult to arrange. Much time can be spent travelling, allowing relatively little time for actual monitoring, particularly if the monitors must visit several schools. It is not easy to identify qualified Afghan monitors who know something about education. This is particularly true for the Farsi-speaking north, since the vast majority of refugees in Pakistan are Pushtoon. One advantage in having staff based in Quetta, as do the ECA and Muslim Aid, is that it is easier to cover the south and west of Afghanistan, and to develop the contacts necessary for identifying refugees who could serve as monitors for these areas.

The AEC tries to have every school checked once a year. They also sometimes follow up with travellers coming to Peshawar from

the area, particularly if they begin to hear rumors that there are problems. They have one investigator who makes inquiries in Peshawar, and rely on a second, Swedish Committee investigator based in Quetta. They use short-term personnel to travel inside to monitor schools. Sometimes the AEC has stopped support for schools when reports were not submitted or some substantial abuse of their assistance occurred. Muslim Aid uses primarily its own permanent staff to monitor schools, but then it has a substantial staff who also fill other functions. Monitoring teams visit schools frequently, between two and six times per year depending on location and accessibility from Peshawar and Quetta. ECA monitors try to visit their schools once materials have been sent. Monitoring began about one year ago. The ECA has a permanent corps of monitors and the new district supervisors will essentially fill some monitoring functions as well. A total of 636 schools out of 1,610 have been monitored as of October 1988 and are now approved to receive teachers' salaries, in-service training and re-supply. Roughly half the monitoring teams are not back yet so more schools will become eligible for salaries in the coming few months.

Three groups, the AEC, ECA/UNO and Muslim Aid use short-term staff to do some monitoring. One of the reasons for using short-term staff is that it is difficult to ensure full-time employment, particularly for the colder regions. All three groups will use monitors repeatedly if the results are satisfactory. The ECA composes a monitoring team of one permanent monitor and two short-term individuals recommended by different parties. UNO back-up monitoring is conducted by short-term personnel recommended by the parties.

In addition to relying on short-term and permanent Afghan staff, many of these NGOs rely on expatriate travellers to double check schools. In the case of the Norwegian Committee, they ask their medical teams to visit schools. MSF does the same. UNO, the AEC and NCA will ask Europeans travelling at the behest of other agencies to visit schools as the opportunity arises. Muslim Aid receives informal reports from the many Arabs participating in the Jihad.

Generally, monitors must be from the same province as the one to which they are travelling or from a neighboring one. It may be better, however, if they are not from the same district, since too many pressures may be put on them. They must also be from the same ethnic group. One cannot send a Pushtoon from Wardak to Badakhshan or Baghlan, and vice-versa. The monitor from Wardak can however go to Ghazni and perhaps to Paktika and Paktia. A further consideration is party affiliation. A member of Hizb-e-Islami may be uneasy about visiting a Jamiyat-e-Islami-controlled area and vice-versa.

As noted, the development of staff based permanently inside

TABLE IV.2
DISTRIBUTION OF NGO-SUPPORTED SCHOOLS IN AFGHANISTAN

	AEC	AFRANE	SOLID. AFGHAN.	ISRA	NCA	MUSLIM AID	MSF	ECA/UNO**
NORTHEAST								
TOTAL	59	35				6	54	45
Badakhshan	41	35				3	54	
Takhar	18					3		
EAST								
TOTAL	24			6		81		61
Kunar	12			1		20		
Laghman	4					10		
Nangarhar	8					51		
Paktia				5				
EAST CENTRAL								
TOTAL	75	36	13	8	42	97		170
Ghazni	25	11			42	27		
Logar*	20	24		1		38		
Wardak	55	1	13	7		32		
SOUTH								
TOTAL	21					43		79
Helmand						5		
Kandahar	8					18		
Nimroz						1		
Paktika	13					11		
Zabul						8		
WEST								
TOTAL	26	7		1		6		0
Farah	4					1		
Ghor	7					1		
Herat	15	7		1		4		
Badghis								

*Afrane's schools in Logar are jointly supported by Solidarite Afghanistan.

	AEC	AFRANE	SOLID. AFGHAN.	ISRA	NCA	MUSLIM AID	MSF	ECA/UNO*
CENTRAL								
TOTAL	50			2		5		124
Bamiyan	20							
Parwan	27							
Kabul						2		
Kapisa				2				
Uruzgan	3					3		
NORTH								
TOTAL	95	2		1		14		168
Balkh	20					1		
Faryab	12					3		
Jowzjan	22					7		
Samangan	5			1				
Kunduz						1		
Baghlan	36	2				2		

*These are schools that have been verified. Not all ECA/UNO monitoring teams have returned from the field, so the total number of schools, particularly for the west, will be higher. ECA-supported schools are listed by region rather than province because the information was given to the consultant in this form.

should permit more consistent monitoring and teacher-training. It will be expensive, however, since each group will want to have its own staff. Priority for the placement of such personnel should be given to more distant areas which are harder to monitor from Pakistan, and to areas with large concentrations of schools. Arrangements, of course, must then be made periodically to monitor the monitors.

Most of the groups have set reporting forms that request information on student enrollment, teacher and student attendance and the like. Muslim Aid monitors collect considerable information regarding educational needs in an area, in the hope that further expansion of Muslim Aid activities can occur. All groups try to review the quality of teaching and are increasingly trying to combine the functions of monitoring and teacher/headmaster training in one team. This is a very useful direction, but it is even more difficult to locate personnel who can be trained as teacher trainers. Such personnel need to be made permanent staff, in order to enable adequate training and experience to be provided to them. Teacher training is discussed in more detail in section VI.

D. Coverage

In the absence of good data, it is very difficult to estimate overall school need and coverage by province. No attempt will be made to do so here. Table IV.2 shows the distribution of NGO-supported schools in Afghanistan. Those provinces receiving the most NGO support for primary schools are Ghazni, Wardak, Logar, Badakhshan and Baghlan. Muslim Aid, the AEC and the ECA/UNO all have good concentrations of schools in the first three provinces. The AEC has more schools in the north and northeast, while Muslim Aid has concentrated to a greater extent on the eastern border provinces. Not surprisingly, the fewest NGO-supported schools are found in the north, west and to some extent the south. The west and north are very hard to reach. The south has been badly damaged and has witnessed heavy fighting during much of the war. Some of its provinces have also had less interest traditionally in education.

In terms of identifying new sites, there is an interest in serving unserved populations but these organizations must be practical. They must work in areas that are peaceful, that they can reach and where they find a responsible person with whom to work. They must also pay attention to maintaining a balance between the tanzeems.

The vast majority of students in NGO-supported schools are enrolled in the first three grades. Enrollment drops significantly in the third grade and by the fourth grade, roughly half the number of students attending first grade are still

Table V.6
COMPARISON OF PERCENTAGE OF TEACHING TIME DEVOTED TO RELIGION BY VARIOUS ORGANIZATIONS

	AEC	CAR	ECA	ISRA	MUSLIM AID
FIRST GRADE	39%	20%	44%	44%	48%
SECOND GRADE	40%	38%	44%	44%	52%
THIRD GRADE	40%	38%	44%	44%	52%
FOURTH GRADE	27%	38%	30%	30%	33%
FIFTH GRADE	27%	29%	30%	30%	33%
SIXTH GRADE	27%	23%	30%	30%	33%

TABLE IV.3

STUDENTS ENROLLED PER GRADE IN NGO-SUPPORTED PRIMARY SCHOOLS*

	GRADE 1	GRADE 2	GRADE 3	GRADE 4	GRADE 5	GRADE 6
AEC	15015	14971	14161	6992	3283	2056
ECA/UNO	34294	24117	20347	4482	2374	1319
MUSLIM AID	13236	7799	5039	6992	3283	2056
NCA	1156	817	714	439	0	0
GAF**	40	25	10			
TOTAL	63741	47729	40271	18905	8940	5431
PERCENTAGE OF STUDENTS PER GRADE	0.34	0.26	0.22	0.1	0.05	0.03

*Afrane, Medecins sans Frontieres and Solidarite Afghanistan did not have per grade enrollment figures.
**Estimated numbers per grade

Table V.1
TIME TABLE OF THE AFGHANISTAN EDUCATION COMMITTEE
PERIODS PER WEEK
Teaching periods are 35 - 45 minutes long.

	1ST GRADE	2ND GRADE	3RD GRADE	4TH GRADE	5TH GRADE	6TH GRADE
HOLY QU'RAN	6	6	6	4	4	4
ISLAMIYAT	6	6	6	4	4	4
MATH	5	6	6	4	4	4
PUSHTO/DARI*	9	10	10	5	5	5
DRAWING	1	1	1	1	1	1
PHYS ED	1	1	1	1	1	1
GEOGRAPHY				2	2	2
HISTORY				2	2	2
2ND LANGUAGE**				4	4	4
SCIENCE/HEALTH				3	3	3
TOTAL	28	30	30	30	30	30

*Mother tongue
**The second language is Dari for native Pushto speakers and vice-versa.

Table V.2
TIME TABLE FOLLOWED IN COMMISSIONERATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS
PERIODS PER WEEK
TEACHING PERIODS ARE 55 MINUTES LONG

	1ST GRADE	2ND GRADE	3RD GRADE	4TH GRADE	5TH GRADE	6TH GRADE
HOLY QU'RAN	6	8	8	8	6	6
ISLAMIYAT		8	8	8	6	5
PUSHTO	6	6	6	6	6	6
MATH	6	8	8	8	6	6
SCIENCE						4
SOCIAL STUDIES*						4
URDU	6	6	6	6	6	6
ENGLISH					6	6
PHYS ED/HEALTH	6	6	6	6	6	3
DRAWING						2
TOTAL	30	42	42	42	42	48

*INCLUDES HISTORY AND GEOGRAPHY

Table V.3
TIME TABLE FOLLOWED IN ECA/UNO SCHOOLS
PERIODS PER WEEK
Teaching periods are approximately 45 minutes long.

	GRADE 1	GRADE 2	GRADE 3	GRADE 4	GRADE 5	GRADE 6
HOLY QU'RAN	6	6	6	4	4	4
ISLAMIYAT	5	5	5	5	5	5
PUSHTO/DARI*	8	8	8	5	5	5
MATH	3	3	3	4	4	4
ART	2	2	2	2	2	2
JEHAD TRAINING**	1	1	1	1	1	1
2ND LANGUAGE***				4	4	4
SOCIAL STUDIES				3	3	3
SCIENCE				2	2	2
TOTAL	25	25	25	30	30	30

*Mother tongue
**Phsyical Education
***Dari for Pushto-speakers and vice-versa

Table V.4
TIME TABLE OF THE ISLAMIC RELIEF AGENCY
PERIODS PER WEEK
Teaching periods are 45 minutes long

	1ST GRADE	2ND GRADE	3RD GRADE	4TH GRADE	5TH GRADE	6TH GRADE
HOLY QU'RAN	6	6	6	4	4	4
ISLAMIYAT	6	6	6	5	5	5
MATH	4	4	4	3	3	3
PUSHTO/DARI*	9	8	8	4	4	4
DRAWING	2	2	2	2	2	2
PHYS ED		1	1	1	1	1
SCIENCE				2	2	2
SOCIAL STUDIES				3	3	3
2ND LANGUAGE**				3	3	3
ARABIC				3	3	3
TOTAL	27	27	27	30	30	30

Table V.5
TIME TABLE FOLLOWED IN MUSLIM AID PRIMARY SCHOOLS
PERIODS PER WEEK
Teaching periods are approximately 45 minutes long.

	1st GRADE	2nd GRADE	3rd GRADE	4th GRADE	5th GRADE	6th GRADE
HOLY QU'RAN	6	6	6	4	4	4
ISLAMIYAT	7	8	8	6	6	6
DARI/PUSHTO*	8	7	7	7	5	5
MATH	4	4	4	3	3	3
SECOND LANGUAGE**				2	2	2
ARABIC				4	4	4
SCIENCE				2	2	2
SOCIAL STUDIES				2	2	2
JIHAD TRAINING***	1	1	1	1	1	1
DRAWING	1	1	1	1	1	1
TOTAL	27	27	27	30	30	30

*Mother tongue
**Dari for Pushto speakers and vice-versa
***Physical Education

enrolled. As in the refugee schools, if those working in education hope to produce a child with specific skills or knowledge, they generally have three years to do it. Table IV.3 shows students enrolled per grade in NGO-supported schools.

V. CURRICULA AND TEXTS CURRENTLY IN USE

A. Overview

All the syllabi reviewed for the primary grades, with the exception of the syllabus in use in the Commissionerate schools, are very similar and are based on the pre-war syllabus. In grades one through three, the subjects commonly taught are religion, the mother tongue (Pushto or Dari) and math. There is usually one teacher per grade. In some schools, such as those established by the Islamic Relief Agency (ISRA), teachers specialize in subjects even for the first three grades. In grades four through six, the number of subjects increases and different teachers teach different subjects. Science, social studies (history and geography) and a second language are added. The second language is Dari for Pushto speakers and Pushto for Dari speakers. These are the two major languages of Afghanistan. In schools managed or supported by ISRA and Muslim Aid, Arabic is taught as a separate subject starting in the fourth grade, and the hours devoted to the second Afghan language are half what they are in other timetables. Tables V.1 - V.5 present the timetables for four organizations.

In Commissionerate schools, the syllabus is a blend of the standard GOP school curriculum and the pre-war Afghan curriculum. Urdu is started in in the first grade, while English is added in the fifth class. Science and social studies begin only in the sixth grade. More hours are devoted to physical education than in other Afghan syllabi. No Dari is taught in Commissionerate schools, except for the seven Dari-medium schools in Baluchistan.

Religion is a very important part of the curriculum in each grade for all the schools. Please refer to table V.6 for a comparison.

None of the groups supporting primary education has a proper detailed curriculum, except Pak-German Bas-Ed in Pushto and math for the first grade and the British Pakistan Model School for its very small number of students. Curriculum as used here here means a set of detailed instructions to the teacher about what information must be covered, how it should be covered and in what order it should be covered. Textbooks have substituted for curricula, but these do not help to a significant degree to make up for this lack, since many are not particularly well structured (in terms of a clear and slow progression in material covered),

and they give the teacher few notions about how to present the material. Some are also thin in terms of the information included, so that a teacher who does not have a very good grasp of the subject matter involved and has no notion of the capabilities of each grade level, would be at a loss as to what information to provide. One math book reviewed for the first grade totalled 16 pages. It was only a few months' work at best, and then the teacher would be left with the problem of what to teach and how to arrange the material. At least one case of an ill-prepared teacher going through a mandated textbook a second time was reported to the consultant. Trained teachers could make effective use of these materials because they would know how to supplement them and how to reduce them to components manageable by children. The materials become particularly important in the absence of teachers with adequate knowledge and pedagogical techniques.

A number of different sets of textbooks have been produced in the last ten years. Most of these are based on Afghan textbooks developed by the Ministry of Education under Prime Minister Da'oud or King Zahir Shah. Da'oud-era books are the more recent of the two and were written in 1973-4. They were produced in conjunction with Soviet advisors and therefore contain many favorable references to the Soviet Union. Not surprisingly, such references do not meet with much acceptance among Afghans today.

The sets of textbooks were not reviewed in their entirety or compared carefully. A sample of books, concentrating on the early grades, were reviewed. These included Commissionerate books, Afghanistan Education Committee (AEC) books, Education Center for the Alliance (ECA/UNO) books, and Alliance Education Council books. It should perhaps be said that the consultant is not a primary education specialist but rather a social scientist with adult training experience. The reader should keep this in mind when reading these comments.

Some of these textbooks appear to be similar in layout and organization. This is true for reading and math in the early grades. Some books in fact appear to be almost identical. For example, the ECA/UNO and Alliance Council first and second grade readers and math books are virtually identical in content, although the ECA print is clearer. Such similarities can be advantageous, since they mean more children learning approximately the same things. There are however some important difference in approach between some of the textbooks.

Some informants working in this field think that many of the books available are too abstract. A number of books do not draw their examples from the every day world that children know, and some believe that they are often at too sophisticated a level for the children to follow. Some of the books do seem to move very quickly. Others have more substance in that they progress more

II. INTRODUCTION

A. Primary Education in Pre-War Afghanistan

When discussing the current state of primary education, both in Afghanistan and the refugee camps in Pakistan, it is helpful to keep in mind that the demand for and availability of secular education prior to this decade-long war was very limited. The government had few resources with which to promote education in the countryside so progress, even in primary education, was very slow. In the 1960's, during the "Experiment in Democracy" period, many members of parliament demonstrated great eagerness to expand education in the provinces. Since the Ministry's funds remained very limited, it tried to do this by sharing the expense of primary schools with interested communities. The government paid for teachers and books when a community covered all other costs. Even then, primary schools tended to be concentrated in the towns, with children from surrounding villages required to walk quite far to attend school. There were few modern village schools and almost no separate schools for girls. It was not until the late 1960's that there were high schools in every province, but the quality of these remained low and students who wanted to gain admission to university were virtually obliged to attend one of the better high schools in Kabul.

In addition to these more secular schools, the government tried to establish a parallel system of madrasas or traditional religious schools, which were much favored by conservative, rural parents. The system of government madrasas eventually overshadowed those private madrasas that had preceded it.

The wealthier northern and Farsi speaking provinces had more schools per capita than did the southern, more tribalized provinces. This was partly a reflection of wealth and partly a reflection of attitude toward the importance of education. Attendance in many areas was erratic and the drop out rate high, even in the early primary grades.

While there was some improvement in quality through the 1960s and 1970s, with more teachers receiving training, teaching in many primary schools was poor and the schools were badly supplied and equipped. Teaching in general did not attract the most qualified graduates. The first Teacher Training Institute (TTI) was established in the late 1950's, and by the start of the war, there was almost one Institute per province. There were two tracks. For primary schools, students attended a TTI after the tenth grade for two years. For secondary school teaching, they enrolled in a TTI for two years after graduating from secondary school. Not all teachers attended a TTI, although there was more of an effort to ensure that secondary school teachers did so. Even at the high school level in rural areas, however, one would sometimes find teachers who themselves had only a twelfth grade education. Female teachers were not usually found outside the

slowly and include more examples and more information at each level. For those books reviewed, all of the first and second grade readers, with the exception of the Pak-German Pushto materials, could benefit from substantial revision.

One important debate seems to occur over the amount of religious and Jihad training given children. For all groups preparing primary school curricula and materials, religius education is important. Some believe that it is very important to reinforce religious knowledge and an understanding of the Jihad by teaching about these through other subjects. The sharpest debate seems to occur over the teaching of language arts in the early grades. Some first and second grade primers draw many or most of their topics from religious beliefs and practice and the long struggle of the Afghan people against Soviet intervention in their country. The authors and users of these books believe very strongly in this approach. Others, who also support good religious training, believe that literacy must be taught through concrete objects that children know. They believe that trying to teach language arts by using abstract ideas makes it much harder for the children to learn to read and write. They point out that children learn by moving from what they know to what they do not know, and that their capacity to handle abstractions is very limited. The question should perhaps be over the choice of religious terms. A mosque is not an abstraction but is a concrete object. Prayer can be demonstrated, but other choices, such as the pilgrimage to Mecca and the concept of fasting during Ramadan may be harder for small children to grasp.

Three first grade Farsi and one Pushto primer were reviewed. They were all similar in format and two were virtually identical. No pre-reading preparation is offered. The letters of the alphabet are shown in their independent position, and not their beginning, medial or final positions in a word. Letters can differ in shape according to their position in a word. Knowing the form they take relative to their position is critical to learning reading and writing. It is true that children are taught the Arabic alphabet at the same time, in their study of the Qu'ran and since many of the letters have the same shape and sound this is some reinforcement. However, pronunciation of some letters, either alone or in combination with other letters, is quite different in Arabic and could serve merely to confuse the child.

In these texts, a word starting with the given letter and then a sentence with new words and unknown sounds/letters follows. The texts do not show how the letters are connected. By the sixth letter of the alphabet, on page six of one primer, for example, three sentences follow the word. Sometimes one of these sentences does not use the given word and sometimes it uses a different form of the word. Many of the words chosen to illustrate the sounds and letters in two of the primers (Alliance

Education Council and ECA) concerned religion and some were abstractions, while the third primer, written by the AEC, used concrete objects like flowers and cups. The Commissionerate Pushto primer also used concrete objects and was the only text with colored pictures of the objects. The AEC primer asks questions about every object, in order to involve the students actively and to increase their knowledge about other matters. These primers are generally very dense and do not seem very "user-friendly."

One problem with the script in three of the above-mentioned books is that the letters are not drawn distinctly and clearly. The books are produced by calligraphers, and calligraphy is an art form. Calligraphers are trained to think more about the handsomeness of their script than the ease with which children can read it. The clearest script was found in the Pak-German materials, and staff there say that they continue to simplify the script to enable students to identify letters more easily. The Commissionerate Pushto primer also had a clear script.
The first and second grade math books cover, in general, counting, addition and subtraction in the first grade, and those topics plus division and multiplication in the second grade. They vary in the amount of practice included in the texts, ranging from a second grade Commissionerate book of 24 pages to an AEC second grade book of 115 pages. In the ECA math book reviewed, roughly 1/3 to 1/2 of the questions in the arithmetic section asked students to count guns, pistols, bullets of different sizes, grenades, and knives. While these are familiar objects to the children of a country traumatized by war, one might question the appropriateness of such choices for six year olds. On the other hand, such objects are more interesting to boys than flowers or pencils, and weapons are traditionally important in Pushtoon culture.

B. Afghanistan Education Committee (AEC) Books

Since the AEC's two senior curriculum department staff came from the Alliance Education Committee and had had a role in writing the books discussed in "C." below, the AEC took the Alliance books as a base and improved upon them. Only Afghans were involved in developing the texts. AEC expatriate staff were very careful to stay out of this area because of the sensitivities regarding foreign involvement in what Afghan children are taught. Curriculum Department staff did use short-term Afghan consultants to help in writing the texts. These texts were reviewed with the tanzeems. Staff continue to solicit suggestions and comments from communities in Afghanistan.

Examples are drawn from the everyday world of children, and there has been some criticism that there are not enough examples drawn from Islam and the Jihad. Many of the books include brief

suggestions and instructions for teachers in presenting the material. One useful feature is that health education is started in the fourth grade. The math books appear to be systematic and to offer more opportunities for practice than most of the other math books available. Some criticism has also been made concerning numerous printing mistakes, but such errors are a feature of other books as well. Dari-usage in some of the Dari-medium books has also been questionned.

Three of the Afghan political parties have asked the AEC to supply its schools in Pakistan with books. This should indicate some level of political acceptability. The AEC, however, has not been permitted to distribute these books here in Pakistan, although they are in use in a few private schools. These books are primarily used in AEC and other-NGO supported schools (Norwegian Committee and MSF) inside Afghanistan. These books do not appear to be favored by the Alliance which wishes to place greater emphasis on religion and the Jihad and prefers to disseminate books developed by its own personnel and expressing its own points of view.

C. Alliance Education Committee Books

These were produced roughly five years ago, apparently using mostly Da'oud era books as a base. References to the Soviet Union were omitted, and references to the Jihad and Islam increased. One group working in primary education says it uses these books not because it feels they are the best but because they are among the more politically acceptable. They have to some extent been superceded by books produced more recently by different Alliance committees.

D. Cultural Center for the Afghan Jihad Books

These were written by Prof. Kushkaki and staff at the center. They are said to be based at least in part on the primary school texts produced by the Ministry of Education with technical assistance from Columbia University. Like the Columbia books, they are reported to be very difficult for poorly trained or untrained teachers to use. Their acceptability to the Alliance is not clear since they were developed without reference to the tanzeems. The Center has reportedly given up producing textbooks since it has found no clients for the existing ones. There is some indication, however, that Commander Masood may try them in the north.

E. Education Center for Afghanistan (ECA) Books

These textbooks were prepared by subject specialists at the ECA, along with some outside specialists on contract. No University of Nebraska (UNO) staff, who work generally in an advisory capacity to the ECA, were involved in the initial preparation of the texts, again because of sensitivities. These texts were produced under some time constraints owing to a desire to get the project underway. Therefore, the books are a combination of some new material and other material borrowed and perhaps adapted from pre-existing texts. UNO staff say that only the religion books are completely new. Like the AEC, the ECA also has health education materials for the fourth, fifth and sixth grades.

These books have been distributed to schools inside Afghanistan up through the fourth grade. Fifth and sixth grade texts are currently being prepared and will be distributed in 1989. All books were reviewed by the ECA advisory board which included one representative from six of the seven tanzeems belonging to the Alliance. In the past five months, the books through grade four have all been reviewed and revised by the ECA with the assistance of Professor A. Azimi, a very respected theologian and former Rector of Kabul University, who was brought back from Kuwait by UNO to work with the project. During this revision, calligraphic and other errors have been corrected.

These textbooks are among the more politically acceptable books to the parties and Afghan refugee communities, and were the books chosen by the tanzeems for their schools being supported by IRC in the tribal agencies. A few communities inside, previously supplied with Afghanistan Education Committee books by the NGOs Afrane and Solidarite Afghanistan (France), have recently opted for ECA books. UNO staff note that the Commissionerate has discussed the possibility of using these books in their refugee schools. The Commissionerate is also experimenting with Pak-German materials. The hindrance to using the books in Pakistan at least in party schools appears to be funding, since the project is only authorized to spend its USAID grant on cross-border work.

The ECA has developed some helpful cloth visual aids, including number and letter charts and a map of Afghanistan. In addition, small boards with velcro-backed flashcards for arithmetic and reading are provided.

ECA staff are currently contemplating the development of materials to promote awareness of the various types of anti-personnel and anti-tank mines that the Kabul regime and Soviet troops have scattered around the country in large numbers. A decision to do so has not yet been taken but some preliminary posters have been prepared.

F. GOP Commissionerate Books

The Commissionerate uses Pakistani Textbook Board books, particularly for Urdu, and English. Books for the other subjects are a compilation of various Afghan texts. These compilations are prepared by staff at the Education Cell, in consultation with the tanzeems, and then are translated into Urdu for review by Textbook Board staff. They are then printed.

Reportedly, sometimes there are problems with book supply. This is understandable and probably happens in all schools. With a shifting population, competition between schools and erratic attendance, it is difficult to estimate need and to determine what the actual enrollment is. Practially speaking, students must be admitted to school all year round. Commissionerate schools sometimes do not give out the books at the beginning of the school year because they do not know which students will stay. An additional complication is that sometimes Afghan headmasters introduce the texts preferred by their party. The Commissionerate's Education Cell does not look upon this substitution with favor.

The syllabus followed in Commissionerate schools was prepared in consultation with representatives from the tanzeems. The Education Cells have done some experimenting. Initially, they tried to offer instruction in Dari, but found that this was too difficult and costly. Dari speakers were relatively few in number and scattered. They might for example have thirty such pupils in a school, in the different grades. The Commissionerate does not have the resources to prepare special materials and provide Dari-speaking teachers for these students. One year Urdu was dropped from the syllabus because it was thought to be extraneous to the needs of Afghan children. Education cell staff explain that it was re-instated the next year at the request of Afghan advisors.

G. Alliance Education Council Books

These books have been prepared from grades one through twelve by a group of Afghans educators, some from each of the parties belonging to the Alliance, and Arab groups. These books are used by Muslim Aid and the Islamic Relief Agency in their schools. Muslim Aid has just been granted permission to publish the books, which should increase the supply available. There has also been some interest expressed in having the ECA/UNO project publish the books. As noted, at least a few of these books are very similar to the ECA books, but the print in the ECA books is clearer and in larger typeface. However, the ECA has stipulated

books must be submitted for their review and possible correction prior to publication. There apparently are some minor components of some of the religion books that the ECA might want to change.

H. Pak-German Bas-Ed materials

Currently, only first grade materials for Pushto and mathematics for Pushto-medium schools have been written. There are teacher's guides that give explicit day-to-day instructions, students' workbooks, and visual aids, including flash cards and alphabet/number charts. The Pushto materials for Afghan children differ from those for Pakistani children because there are differences in usage of that language. These materials seem excellent. They are very methodical and well structured. They start with very basic points - listening and comprehension exercises, observation skills, recognizing and making line drawings, and learning right from left. In the Pushto text, the script is very clear and the students are introduced to each letter in its different positions in a word. This latter instruction takes place at the end of the first grade but primarily in second grade. Pushto lessons are used to extend the childrens' knowledge of the world around them. The math book devotes several lessons to relative position, arranging objects according to size, relative weight, relationships of size and amount and understanding processes over time, before getting to number 1. Because these materials are designed for Pakistani children as well, religion and the Jihad are not topics in these books. This probably makes them less acceptable to many Afghan parents and community leaders.

These materials are very child-centered, so even though the tasks are very clearly laid out, teachers require good training because the approach is so foreign. Teachers think, for example, that the pre-reading stage is play and that the children are not learning anything important. Staff comment that the teachers with whom they are working are not accustomed to doing much reading so the teachers' workbooks present some difficulties, at least initially. Using these materials does demand more work and preparation from the teacher. The materials are slightly more appropriate for refugee children than Afghans inside (i.e., the use of Pakistani money in counting games) but could be adapted. Currently, only 12 Commissionerate schools are using the materials on a trial basis. Some other Commissionerate schools do use some of the visual aids to augment the regular books. IRC staff have sat in on the training, and Pak-German trainers introduce the materials to teachers being trained in SOS/PG sessions.

I. Tanzeem Books

A number, but not all, of the parties have their own books. This includes Hizb-e-Islami (Hekmatyar), Jamiyat-e-Islami (Rabbani), Mahaz (Gailani) and Jebha (Mojedidi). They vary in quality. For example, Mahaz is said to have produced some good social studies books. Some of the party schools use these books, but frequently the party schools seem to be very poorly supplied when it comes to books and materials. They are probably not much used inside Afghanistan, since they are hard enough for schools to acquire here in Pakistan.

J. Austrian Relief Committee (ARC) Health Education Materials

The ARC has developed health education materials in Pushto for use in Commissionerate schools. An ARC sanitation team trains teachers in camps where they are working over a nine week period to teach the materials to children. There are three sections in the ARC manual. The first section constitutes a course in human biology and disease/prevention for teachers. The second part gives instructions to the teachers on how to teach health education. The third section is made up of thirty sample lesson plans, geared to the eight grade. Initially, staff planned to develop lesson plans for different ages, but this was too time-consuming and too staff intensive. An effort was made to keep the Pushto very simple. ARC staff think that a teacher with an eight grade education can understand the manual. The English version, which was reviewed by this consultant, seemed rather sophisticated and complex for many teachers in Commissionerate schools (or other Afghan schools) to follow. The section for teachers may be concentrating too much on anatomy and physiology, particularly for teachers of the lower primary grades. The section on how to teach health education is also complex. It is not divided into clear messages and is probably too theoretical for teachers with little or no pedagogical training to be able to use.

There is a set of flashcards, that duplicates the drawings in the teachers' manual, for use with the children. The flashcards have not yet been tested, but the plan is to do this soon. The ARC has turned to IRC's Health Education Resource Center (HERC) for assistance in developing materials for the primary grades. HERC has agreed to develop children's stories which will illustrate basic health messages.

K. Action Internationale Contra la Faim (AICF)

The AICF does not currently have written health education materials for teachers or students. It has, however, requested

the Saudi Red Crescent in Quetta to prepare a list of Hadith, or sayings of the Prophet, that can be used to support health messages.

VI. TEACHER TRAINING

The quality of the teachers overall is low, although there may be regional differences. More than one organization commented that many of the trainees in their teacher training program have great trouble reading Pushto (their native language) and do not have a good grasp of such basics in arithmetic as "carrying over" in addition and "taking away" in subtraction. They also do not understand how to divide a larger number into a smaller one. One NGO pointed to the recent example of a trainee who thought that there were five angles in a triangle and who proved very hard to convince otherwise. Content information is and will have to remain an important part of most training programs.

Perhaps the most difficult issue to address in training is the prediliction for teaching by rote memorization and chanting. The use of student-centered methods is rare. Improving methods requires changing teacher attitudes. The teachers must also be willing to put more effort into preparing lessons.

A. FOR REFUGEES

Almost all of the training opportunities for primary school teachers in recent years have been made available to refugees. Most groups training teachers in Pakistan and developing curricula or textbooks for refugee schools do so in Pushto and not in Farsi, so the pool of Farsi-speakers who have training or experience in facets of primary education is not getting much bigger. Most of those receiving training are Pushtoons from Nangarhar, Konar, Laghman, Logar, Paktia, and Parwan, and to a lesser extent from the south and west.

There has been more in-service training organized than pre-service training. Most of the training has been provided in Pakistan's Northwest Frontier Province. Probably roughly half the opportunities for training are for teachers in Commissionerate schools and have been supported by UNHCR. The other half have been provided with private funds by NGOs for teachers in party and private schools. By rough estimates, approximately 4,000 teachers have been trained, although some of these have received training in more than one program.

Most NGOs providing training use a mix of Pakistani and Afghan teacher trainers. Not all the trainers have backgrounds in

teacher training, but several have attended TTIs or Faculties of Education. Many have been teachers for years.

1. In-Service Training

In-service training courses are offered by various groups and range from a few afternoons to four months in length. Roughly three thousand teachers have been trained, some of whom are Pakistani teachers in Commissionerate schools. Some of the Afghan tanzeems also try to provide some training to teachers in their schools. The various NGO and CAR training programs are as follows:

a. Currently Active

Action Internationale Contra la Faim (AICF): AICF trained teachers in 24 CAR primary and middle schools in sanitation and hygiene in 1987, and this year is working with 30 refugee schools. Of the latter, half are Commissionerate schools and half are Qu'ranic schools. Three Afghan teacher trainers provide one hour of training per day to teachers over a two week period. The teachers then teach the lesson presented in the mornings to their students in the afternoons, under the supervision of the teacher trainers. The teachers then should continue to teach the same basic messages over the course of the school year. There are no written materials or visual aids developed as yet to support this training, or to help the teachers adapt the content to the particular grade they are teaching. Staff may work with the Experiment in International Living project to develop such materials. AICF hopes to assess past teacher training next March, at the start of the new school year, and then organize refresher training. They will also work with a new group of schools next year. They also expect to augment their training staff with the addition of three teacher trainers, to make a total of six. Each school in which AICF does this training is provided with latrines and a sand filter for purifying drinking water.

Austrian Relief Committee (ARC): The ARC trains teachers in Commissionerate schools to teach sanitation and some general health education in camps in Mardan, Haripur and Peshawar districts of NWFP. Sessions are offered for one hour per day over a nine week period and the trainers observe the teachers teach the materials to their pupils during that period. Eight sessions have been organized since 1986. The ARC is re-thinking this program since staff think that the nine week period is too long. They would like to train teachers for a few hours a week over a shorter period. This will require restructuring the content.

Education Cells of the Commissionerate: In-service training began in 1984 in NWFP. Two or three sessions of three weeks in duration are organized each summer in Peshawar for both Afghan and Pakistani male teachers. Each autumn, a similar program is organized for female teachers. Approximately 400 teachers are trained in one summer. Thirty-five to forty female teachers are trained each year. Most female teachers in NWFP have now received training. Selection is partly by regional quota, and priority is given to new teachers and to those who have not yet received the training. The sessions cover content and methodology.

The following were some of the subjects covered in last summer's workshops for male teachers:

Pushto/Urdu and teaching methods	6 periods of 50 minutes
English and teaching methods	7 periods of 50 minutes
Islamiyat and teaching methods	7 periods of 50 minutes
Arithmetic and teaching methods	6 periods of 50 minutes
Health Education/hygiene	3 periods of 50 minutes
Child psychology and development	2 periods of 50 minutes

Other topics addressed school administration and record keeping, the importance of games and the use of workbooks. These sessions were geared for third through eight grade teachers. Demonstration lessons in most of the main subjects were given for grades three and up. The students spent one day giving practice lessons in different subjects. Education Cell staff comment that the workshops for female teachers concentrate more on the first three grades. Sometimes the female training sessions incorporate some home economics topics.

Until 1987, the Education Cell in Baluchistan organized similar two two- week workshops every summer for 60-80 teachers. Now EIL is training CAR teachers (see summary below).

Experiment in International Living (EIL): Currently, EIL is one of two groups offering teacher training in Baluchistan, along with the Islamic Relief Agency. Approximately 183 teachers have been trained. The trainees are drawn from Afghanistan's southern and western provinces for the most part. For almost the past two years, EIL has been providing six hours of training per month, over the course of the school year, to a set number of teachers in CAR schools. EIL works in five districts, where they have district centers managed by a coordinator, in Baluchistan. All the trainers are based in Quetta. Some of the camps in which the training is conducted are very far from Quetta. This has limited both the amount of training that could be provided to teachers and time trainers could spend in the head office. The syllabus for the training has not been set but the six trainers conduct a considerable amount of clinical observation in the classroom, and

main towns and cities.

Teaching methods were generally poor with great emphasis put on rote memorization and mindless repetition. Students who made it through the sixth grade had few skills and insufficient knowledge to earn access to higher education or better jobs. Yet they had received no training to make them better farmers and often did not want to return to farming. This kind of result, not surprisingly, was seen as unproductive by parents and helped discredit secular education. Partly this was a problem of the economy and not just education. The first wave of students to gain an education (particularly secondary and university) in the 1960s gained good jobs in the civil service and rose fast in the bureaucracy. However, the government did not have the funding to expand employment in the civil service significantly, and there was no private sector that offered alternative employment. Thus, there were very few oppportunities for the second wave of students, finishing courses in the 1970s. These unemployed and discontented students proved a fruitful field for revolutionary cultivation.

The written materials available for primary education were not very good. A series of primary school textbooks, that were reported to be good, were developed over a ten year period with technical assistance from Columbia University and U.S.A.I.D. These textbooks tried to promote better teaching techniques but the Ministry of Education found that teachers with no pedagogical training had great trouble using the books. They could not adapt to the suggested methods. These books however have indirectly turned out to be useful because different groups currently working in education have referred to them in writing new texts for the primary grades.

B. The Effect of the War on Education

Many schools buildings have been damaged or destroyed in the war and many trained teachers have been killed. Some teachers fled and still teach in Pakistan. Many have left the profession to take part in the Jihad and some have chosen to pursue more lucrative work. As in other disciplines, many of the more qualified education specialists have emigrated abroad. The pool of teachers qualified by virtue of having at least a Teacher Training Institute degree has grown smaller, and there are probably many teaching with less than adequate knowledge and qualifications. A few years into the war, most teacher training institutes were closed because the government could not sustain them. Instead, the government appointed secondary or middle school graduates as teachers.

In effect education in many areas outside the main towns and cities came to a halt. In the first years of the war, little

try to incorporate their findings into their training. Teachers take part in a monthly three-day seminar. Classroom observation in the morning is followed by a two hour seminar in the afternoons.

Staff are currently designing a syllabus for the training, and plan to reduce some of the classroom observation in favor of having the trainers give demonstration lessons in the schools. The project director is working closely with the teacher trainers to upgrade training skills, and hopes during the next school year to have the trainers spend more time in the Quetta office preparing training sessions and materials under his supervision.

Each year EIL works with a new group of teachers. This coming academic year, staff would like to take a group of 150 previously trained teachers, in order to ensure that there is a substantial upgrading of teacher skills. This is currently being discussed with the Additional Secretary, Education of CAR.

International Rescue Committee (IRC): Currently, the IRC has two monitors/teacher-trainers giving feedback and demonstrating improved techniques to teachers in the five inter-party schools it is supporting.

It also has just started offering half-day sessions during a week-long training program to teachers in its Talamat-e-Diniyat program. These are first grade classes, enrolling mostly girls, organized in refugee homes in the Hungu-Thal area. There are sixteen such schools at present but IRC expects to establish a total of 75 such classes. Once this training is well under way, IRC will then examine the possibility of offering training to teachers in the party schools it is supporting in Kurram, Kohat and Waziristan agencies. It also expects to provide follow up assistance for whatever training is offered.

Islamic Relief Agency (ISRA): ISRA has trained roughly 1700 male teachers and 22 female teachers in NWFP and Baluchistan. In Quetta, two sessions, in which 150 male teachers were trained, took place. In NWFP, training has been organized in five different locations. The teachers were trained in one month courses that covered content and methodology but did not include Pushto. ISRA now plans to offer longer in-service training programs because staff have concluded that the trainees are of too low a quality to be able to accomplish much in one month. There will now be special courses for language arts and others for math and science. For example, a three month math and science course for middle school teachers is currently taking place in Peshawar. Trainees are drawn either from party schools or from ISRA's own schools.

SOS/PG: Roughly 400 Afghan primary school teachers from Commissionerate schools in Peshawar district of NWFP have been trained in ten four-month sessions. The Education Cell nominates candidates. Because some candidates in the past have had a very low level of knowledge, staff have generally divided the trainees into two groups, according to ability. There is an admissions or placement examination, and staff are seeking approval from the CAR to exclude those teachers who cannot pass it. Training is given in Pushto, Islam, mathematics, science, psychology and pedagogy. Textbooks in these subjects have been written especially for the training program. Much of the emphasis, of necessity, has been placed on content information. There is also a mobile teacher training team that is currently working with teachers in ten schools in five different camps. This constitutes a second track for in-service training, although some of the teachers in these ten schools were trained previously in SOS/PG's four month program. In addition, staff organize fifteen day courses in school organization and administration for Afghan headmasters in Commissionerate schools. Four sessions training a total of 120 headmasters have been offered to date.

b. Planned

British Pakistan Model School and Teacher Training Program: This is a private model school organized last March in Quetta. It currently enrolls 30 children from kindergarten through fourth grade. Fifth and sixth grades will open in January, and the school should have an enrollment of 70 by March 1989. The principal plans to train Pakistani and Afghan teachers through this school. Twelve week sessions will enroll 30 teachers at a time, with follow up assistance provided once the teachers return to their schools.

2. Pre-Service Training

The only group currently providing training to prepare new teachers is ISRA. It runs a one year diploma course for secondary school graduates. Admission is by examination. The first group of 80 graduated in December 1987. Another group will finish December 1988. Both these groups were trained in Peshawar. Two groups have already graduated in Swabi and Samarbagh. In addition, a course is currently being offered in Quetta and students will graduate next April. The syllabus now appears comprehensive, with the recent addition of Pushto. Dari is not taught. The course has now been lenthened to 18 months. One of the five 14-week sessions will be spent practice teaching. The group currently receiving training in Quetta is the first to follow the 18 month course. Trainers are a mix of Pakistanis and Afghans.

B. INSIDE AFGHANISTAN

On the regime side, there may still be a few Teacher Training Institutes operating in urban areas, training female teachers to teach in city schools. Some communities may try to organize their own teacher training but such efforts are few and far between. As one example, the Afghanistan Education Committee (AEC) has been supporting school officials in Badakhshan in training the latter would like to organize. For teachers in liberated areas, training is just beginning on a very modest scale. The AEC has recently organized a few teams of mobile teacher-trainers, who have now visited a few provinces. These trainers report that teachers and commanders are very interested in this training. Muslim Aid has trained its teachers in Konar province in two one-month sessions, just across the border in Pakistan, but is now planning to train teachers via mobile teams. The ECA is also initiating teacher training through its on-site district supervisors. ISRA is now organizing teacher training for two provinces.

It is difficult to find qualified candidates on either side of the border to do the teacher training. Moving from school to school and from party area to party area can be very hazardous. Most of these NGOs currently search for their teacher trainers in Pakistan, so that they can brief them fully and can send them to more than one province. Such travelling is very time-consuming, and there are not many who want to go on extended trips. All these groups are trying to move toward basing teacher trainers/monitors inside in a province or district, but again, the pool of qualified candidates willing to spend long periods inside is very limited at this point. Where possible, it is probably best to identify candidates inside and bring them out for training as teacher-trainers. This is the approach the ECA took toward identifying district supervisors, who will have some responsibility for teacher training. It can, however, be very difficult to identify suitable candidates in some areas. Muslim Aid is currently examining the possibility of supporting the establishment of a teacher training institute in the north.

VII. RECURRENT COSTS

The U.N. Coordinator's First Consolidated Report estimates that, following the return of the refugees, a 40% enrollment rate of children between the ages of six and fourteen would require 38,527 teachers. Given that there currently is probably less than an eighteen per cent enrollment rate among refugee children in Pakistan, and a rate that is estimated to be similar in Afghanistan, it is perhaps unrealistic to use the 40% figure as a

target or base for estimating need. Even before the war, only 30% of eligible children were enrolled in school. Education may now be even less of a priority, and children's labor may be needed to help families re-establish themselves on the land. If we use a 25% enrollment figure as a somewhat more realistic target, this would suggest a need for 24,080 teachers through class nine.

Expatriate donors currently pay teachers in Afghanistan between Rs. 600 and Rs. 800 per month. Two of the three largest groups working inside (the AEC and Muslim Aid) pay Rs. 600 - 650. The ECA/UNO project, which supports roughly 900 schools, but is only currently paying salaries to teachers in 636 schools, pays Rs. 800 monthly. As staff explained, this is slightly more than a master sargeant earns in the Afghan army, and it was felt necessary to pay salaries that could attract and keep qualified individuals. It is perhaps unfortunate that there was not more coordination on the salary level, since the Rs. 800 figure may be inflationary and could serve to attract teachers away from schools supported by other groups, setting up an unnecessary competition. In fact, the AEC was paying less than 600 Rs. per month but felt obliged to increase this salary, partly because of the higher ECA salary. The AEC and Muslim Aid jointly seem to have agreed on 600 Rs. per month, while the ECA/UNO project has now agreed to freeze its salary at Rs. 800.

At an average monthly salary of 700 Rs. per teacher, 24,080 teachers would cost about Rs. 194 million or USD 10.5 million annually. This of course does not include other recurrent school costs such as books, supplies, salaries for other staff, facility construction or maintenance, transport, etc.

The AEC currently pays an average of about 24 Rs. for books and 43 Rs. for material for each student per year. For a class of 40 students, the transportation costs average 3000 Rs. (an average of 375 Rs. per "seer" (an Afghan unit of weight equalling 7 kg.), with the supplies weighing 8 seer). This is more than the actual books and materials cost, since these total 2,680 Rs. for 40 students. The combined package for one class of 40 students costs 5,680 Rs. per year or Rs. 142 per student. Muslim Aid estimates that they spend 40 Rs for books and 35 Rs. for supplies (including floor tarp) per student. If we use 20,000 classes as a very rough estimate of initial need, the cost equals Rs. 113.6 million or USD 6.2 million annually. However, it should increasingly be possible to buy supplies locally, inside Afghanistan, and perhaps also to publish books locally. Currently most books are published in Lahore. The AEC is experimenting in a few places with funding the procurement of supplies locally. Muslim Aid staff deliver books and often buy supplies locally. It is easier for them to do this since they send their own staff with the books. This reduces transportation costs and also reduces the cost per item. Good purchased in

Pakistan are more expensive than those made and sold in Afghanistan. It is possible that help could be given to setting up small income generating projects to produce notebooks, slates, blackboards, rulers and the like.

The University of Nebraska estimates that the ECA is spending Rs. 362 per student for salaries of staff inside, transportation, books, and supplies. Muslim Aid estimates that they spend roughly 648 Rs. per student per year, including all costs related to the education program. If those 20,000 classes mentioned above have an average of 40 students each, then providing those students with primary education would cost, using the Muslim Aid figure, Rs. 518,400,000 or USD 28,327,868. This does not include construction or school refurbishment costs.

It is hard to imagine that recurrent costs of this magnitude can be sustained by an Afghan Government or Governments over the next five or so years, presuming that one that has some reach into the countryside comes to power, when there are so many other priorities and when the resource base will be so small. In many areas, communities will find it hard to make much of a contribution since the rehabilitation of housing and agriculture will consume all their resources for several years.

The U.N. Coordinator has requested USD 50 million for education for 1988-9. Of this sum, USD 26.5 million is to be spent on rehabilitating school buildings, while USD 9 million is provisionally allocated for supplying and equipping primary and secondary schools. Nothing is allocated for the above-mentioned recurrent costs unless the USD 9 million includes the provision of books, notebooks, pencils and the like. This budget omits any support for teachers' salaries and other school personnel salaries, which would leave these to bilateral donors to fund.

VIII. CONSTRAINTS AND ISSUES

The over-riding constraints in structuring assistance programs for Afghanistan are the limited absorbtive capacity of both Afghan communities inside and the NGOs through which donors channel funds. Political power is fragmented and is likely to remain so for the mid-term future, fighting still takes place in many areas and could potentially break out in others where tensions are high, and there are few administrative structures inside with which an implementing agency can work. The NGOs, for the most part, are small organizations with a limited ability to spend large sums of money. For examples, two of the three largest groups working cross-border spend around USD 1 million per year on their cross-border program. Five of the nine groups currently supporting schools inside are not primarily interested

in education and are supporting schools because they have undertaken other activities in an area. Several groups are voluntary or semi-voluntary with few staff and/or considerable staff turn-over. Some have very little in-house technical expertise in education or development and draw to a considerable extent on relatively young expatriates for their senior management staff. In addition, some of these NGOs have very small home offices with limited backstopping capability. While the need in Afghanistan in all sectors in enormous, it is easier to spend money on educating refugee children because a structure is there and it is possible to account for expenditures. In general, the NGO capacity to channel funds responsibly to Afghan communities is also effected by some of the constraints mentioned below.

A. MANPOWER

1. Primary Education Specialists

Skilled manpower is a major constraint on reconstruction in all sectors, including education. It is difficult to find experienced and skilled trainers of teachers and almost impossible to find currriculum development and materials specialists for the primary grades. Most of the organizations working have trouble identifying even short-term staff who can monitor schools appropriately.

Since most of the refugees in Pakistan are Pushtoons, it can be easier to find Pushto-speaking educators. One group commented that it is very hard to find qualified Farsi-speaking candidates who could be trained as teacher trainers for the North.

This shortage of Afghan educationalists is a block to the expansion of NGOs, particularly since education is a very sensitive area and not one in which sustained foreign technical assistance is acceptable. A further problem is that NGOs frequently lose some of their best staff, who have learned their programs and requirements, to emigration, so they are perpetually obliged to find replacements. Some groups do try to circumvent this problem by recruiting Pakistani technocrats and administrators. This is of use, although there can be tensions between the Pakistanis and Afghans. As activities, such as teacher training, increasingly move inside, it will be harder to fill the gap with Pakistanis.

2. Teachers

The lack of trained teachers who have a good grasp of content and understand how children learn is perhaps the single greatest constraint to accomplishing anything in this sector. There are always a few children who will learn, in spite of all the

difficulties, but in general, many if not most children must leave school with little to show for the few years they have spent sitting in a classroom. Improving teaching significantly requires training at a level that neither current organizations nor resources can support. Better materials could make up for some of the poor teaching but would be insufficient in themselves.

There are probably more highly qualified teachers to be found among the refugees than inside the country, except for the Farsi-speaking north. The supply of teachers overall is probably less than needed given high student-teacher ratios, the large number of Pakistanis teaching in Commissionerate schools, and unmet demand inside Afghanistan. However, it probably is not substantially out of line with what can be supported. Estimates can only be made very, very roughly but there may be approximately 10,000 primary school teachers currently teaching inside Afghanistan, including in regime schools; while another 10,000 are teaching in primary grades in Pakistan. In addition, there are refugees who taught school in the past but cannot find, or cannot accept, jobs as teachers. With the exception of the women in this latter category, the qualifications are probably very low. As noted, a 25 % enrollment rate would require around 24,000 primary teachers. However, if refugees and displaced persons return to their home areas over the next two years, enrollments may drop for a time while children help to re-build houses, re-cultivate fields, and so on. In addition, security considerations may affect both enrollments and attendance.

Groups working cross-border report that it is relatively easy to find teachers or those with adequate qualifications to become teachers in Nangarhar, Ghazni, Parwan, Wardak and north of the Hindu Kush. It is not easy in areas which have generated large numbers of refugees and/or where there was little interest in education before the war, such as Zabul, Helmand, Paktika, Kunar, Paktia, Farah, and Nimroz. In addition, it is very difficult if not impossible to find female teachers in rural areas and smaller towns. They tend to be concentrated in urban areas.

B. Curricula and Textbooks

Some working in this sector are concerned about the standardization of curricula and texts. This probably should not be a major concern at this point. Many of the timetables and texts are very similar, so most children are being taught approximately the same topics at the same time. Most children enrolled also do not attend beyond the third grade, which which should reduce the concern about identical materials. The importance of standardized curricula is probably more of a

concern from the late primary grades so that children can compete on equal terms for higher educational opportunities and are sufficiently knowledgeable about their country that they can become responsible citizens. Those differences in approach and material that do exist serve to give communities a choice, and this is of some value. The issue of curricula is very sensitive and attempts at standardization could consume an enormous amount of time and turn out very little product. In addition, future changes in the political situation may produce demands for changes in the materials. Any new central government is likely to want new materials.

The actual writing of curricula and materials are the hardest areas in which to provide technical assistance, and any foreign, and particularly non-Muslim, involvement may doom the outcome to failure. There is some suspicion of the AEC's textbooks, for example, in refugee circles because the AEC is a Swedish based and funded organization. Non-Afghan staff at the AEC had no involvement in the work of the curriculum department, which is entirely Afghan, and only Afghan subject specialists outside the AEC were hired as consultants, but this care shown by the AEC has not negated the suspicions.

One problem that exists in some districts is that various materials are in use, sometimes even in the same schools. One example from one province illustrates the point. The commander in one area oversees 37 schools, although some of these schools have only first and second grade classes with less than 50 children. The total official enrollment is around 3500 children. He is currently receiving support from Afrane, the AEC and the ECA/UNO. There were some difficulties last year in terms of which group was providing what, the amounts paid for salaries and the like. Afrane and the ECA are providing ECA books while the AEC provides their own materials. It would be useful generally to decide on one particular set of books per school "system," but this probably requires NGOs to coordinate their support fairly carefully.

C. School Buildings

According to an estimate in the First Consolidated Report of the U.N. Special Coordinator for Afghanistan, published in September 1988, approximately 2000 schools, or 2/3 the total number of schools existing before the war, have been damaged or destroyed, and abandoned. Greatest damage to schools, of course, has occurred in areas of heavy bombing and fighting - in Nangarhar, Kandahar, Herat, Laghman, Konar , the northeast, and areas around Kabul. In the relatively wealthy and somewhat more peaceful north, school opportunities have actually expanded. Lack of facilities is becoming an increasing problem in some areas as enrollments and number of classes increase. The school outgrows

the local mosque and has no other facility. Many classes already meet outside, perhaps with the shade of a tree as the only shelter. The AEC has noted an increasing demand for assistance with the construction of school buildings, particularly as security improves in an area. Constructing buildings however, should not be a priority, given other rural works needs, and the relative expensiveness of construction. This is particularly true since those areas in which schools have been destroyed or heavily damaged have also experienced extensive damage to roads, housing, irrigations systems, fields, etc. There are also very few NGOs who could handle construction activities in Afghanistan at the present time.

IX. RECOMMENDATIONS

Some thought should be given to the sorts of educational objectives that UNICEF wishes its funding to promote. Rural parents' primary objective in sending children to school is to give their children religious knowledge. This is partly because other subjects are valued less but also because schools have shown themselves to be less than successful at producing any other skills or knowledge of use in the community.

Those NGOs working in this sector are involved primarily in formal primary education. There seems to have been little questionning by any of these groups of the usefulness of traditional primary education to peasant communities. The only innovation in this sector would appear to be the introduction of health education by some NGOs in some grades. A number of groups are also involved in non-formal literacy training, mostly for adults but some for youths.

UNICEF should concentrate its resources and attention on early primary education, when most students are enrolled, and should try to make the teaching more effective and useful to the community. This would involve a concentration on basic literacy and numeracy and the introduction of special topics such as preventive health, childcare and perhaps agriculture. If teaching in the early grades can be improved, there is a greater chance that children will have an adequate base and the interest to continue with education in some form.

Even though access to education was very limited prior to the war, the economy still could not absorb those who had been educated to the middle or secondary level and above, with the end result that a discontented group with some ability to destabilize the polity was produced. There is little point in contemplating this sort of expansion again. It is true that Afghanistan has lost many engineers, doctors and other professionals. The need for replacements is there but by the time they are produced donor

assistance will have waned, and the economy may not be able to generate adequate employment for them. More effort should be placed on providing children with sufficient basic education to permit them to follow lower level technical training: training which would make them better farmers, better farm mechanics, carpenters, masons, and so on.

It could be useful for UNICEF, since it is based in New York, to consult with Columbia University education specialists who were involved in Afghanistan before the war. These individuals, although they have no experience in supporting education under war-time conditions, could help in structuring UNICEF involvement by sharing their sense of lessons learned.

There are four paths that UNICEF can think about following:

1. Support for formal primary education;

2. Support for madrassas or Qu'ran schools, which are acceptable to Afghans, particularly for their daughters, when topics that fit within UNICEF's overall mandate are taught; and

3. Support for literacy cum vocational training for youths.

4. Support for other non-traditional approaches to educating children.

These will be discussed in turn.

A. Formal Primary Education

This is an area where involvement must be long-term if much change is to be witnessed by the donor. If formal schools are to be maintained, then external donor support is necessary for the forseeable future. Priority should be given to developing materials for and training teacher-trainers and teachers for the first three grades. Emphasis needs to be placed on improving the teaching of language arts and arithmetic, particularly for the early grades. Health education and child care topics should be added where possible.

In the process of considering major grants for organizations involved in this sector, UNICEF should try to gain an understanding of the contents of the materials used by that group, so that it has a clear understanding of exactly what kind of instruction it is supporting. One way to do this is to fund a comparison of some of the more heavily used materials.

1. Priority Number 1: Training Teacher Trainers

UNICEF should fund the training of teacher trainers through various NGOs. This should include funding for the provision of

thought was given to education in many parts of the country, since most people were pre-occupied with life and death matters. It was also thought that the war would not last long and that life soon would return to normal. This of course did not happen. Eventually, people realized that their children were going without any education, and they began to try to establish schools. Generally, their resources only extended to re-establishing mosque schools or madrassas. This was true primarily of areas where the security situation permitted children to collect together. As foreign donor support for activities inside grew, commanders and elders began to seek outside support for education. The Afghanistan Education Committee (AEC) has in the past year noted a steady increase in the number of requests for schools, and also believes that a greater number of those individuals making the requests check out to be honest, reliable and genuinely interested in education. This reflects a certain settling or stabilizing of the situation in many areas. The demand now for schools inside the country in the liberated areas exceeds the resources currently available.

Even in urban areas, which are not accessible to NGOs, there appears to be unmet demand for schooling, given the huge expansion in the populations of Kabul and some other major cities, such as Kandahar. It is unlikely that the regime has had the resources to offer places to all children who want them. There are also many families who do not want to send their children to regime schools. Those who have sons of draft age keep the boys at home (or send them to Pakistan) fearing conscription. In addition, in at least some cities, such as Kabul, security concerns oblige parents to keep their children home from school two or three days per week.

The First Consolidated Report of the U.N. High Commissioner estimates that only 18% of children between the ages of 6 and 14 are enrolled in school in Afghanistan. It is not clear on what this percentage is based. In 1978/9, 30% of the children in this age group were enrolled. This is a significant drop, due to the lack of acceptable government-provided education, insecurity in rural areas and towns, the lack of teachers and materials, and the inability of communities to fund schools. Although parents may be more suspicious of education now, this drop does lend some credence to the notion of there is unmet demand for schooling. Often, those NGOs supporting primary education in Afghanistan take over schools that have been organized by a commander, religious authority or elder but which can not be properly supported by the community. The quality of such locally organized schools must, in general, be relatively poor.

C. Current Attitudes Toward Education

It is difficult to assess if there has been a change in attitude

technical assistance for the development of training programs. There is only very limited training of teacher trainers being organized currently, and there are few already with this skill. No materials seem to be available. Much of the training that is going on tends to emphasize improved teaching techniques, an important consideration. However, training needs equally to concentrate on the skills involved in training adults-observation and listening skills, giving feedback, how to address particular and common teacher weaknesses. For the near future, the training of master trainers will probably have to take place in Pakistan.

Virtually all the NGOs involved in primary education are beginning to train teachers, which increases the need for teacher-trainers. For the near term, most candidates will probably be drawn from the refugee pool. Candidates could be chosen from among those who show promise in in-service programs or the few pre-service training programs that exist. They can also be drawn from among those who show a gift for teaching in the classroom. Selection should be done very carefully, in an attempt to ensure a mix from different regions of the country. Candidates should not be restricted to graduates of a certain level, as long as their knowledge is adequate or can be improved without a major effort. Increasingly, groups should try to identify talented teachers in their schools in Afghanistan and arrange training as teacher-trainers. It may for a time be necessary to bring such individuals out for training in order to ensure program quality and adequate resources. One of the advantage of choosing individuals on-site is that it is easier to ensure acceptability to the community. Headmasters can also be trained to help improve the techniques of the teachers under them.

In any training program, emphasis should probably be placed on training teacher trainers who can work with teachers of grades one through three. In particular, this suggests that considerable attention be paid to the introduction of reading and writing in the native language. This is probably the weakest area of teaching.

UNICEF should give first preference to the training of trainers who will work inside Afghanistan, as mobile teacher trainers. UNICEF should also consider funding salaries and transportation costs for teacher trainers working with different NGOs, once the training is completed. More emphasis needs to be placed on training Farsi-speaking teachers and teacher trainers, particularly in language arts.

Special emphasis should be placed on supporting the training of female teacher trainers and female teachers. This is tricky because it is difficult to find a sufficient mass of qualified candidates who are not from the larger towns and cities. Cities

may already be relatively well served with female teachers and, in any case, are likely to be more open toward allowing male teachers to educate female children. Rural areas and smaller towns are more conservative in this regard, so selection for any program training female teacher trainers should ideally be focussed on refugee candidates originally from non-urban areas. However, such candidates may not existin significant numbers. The number of Afghan female teachers currently teaching is small, so the pool of talent from which to draw the trainers is also small. Priority should be given to female teachers currently teaching, since those not teaching may have lost skills and may not resume teaching upon their return to Afghanistan.

2. Priority Number 2: Teacher and Headmaster Training

UNICEF can play a useful role in funding the development of teacher training programs. Many training programs seem to concentrate more on the higher primary grades, perhaps because these are easier to teach. More emphasis should be given to the in-service training of teachers in the first three grades. Headmasters should also receive training in school administration and supervision.

UNICEF should probably direct its funding to teacher and headmaster training being provided in Afghanistan rather than in the camps. Considerable training has been provided to refugee teachers, and there have been no substantive evaluations to indicate the extent to which those trained have been able to integrate and use the training. In addition, those trained tend to come from a limited range of provinces. It is also not clear that all refugee teachers will want to teach at home, given the lower salaries. Many teachers earn more in Pakistan. Those who are under-qualified and obtained their positions through political contacts may also be less acceptable as teachers in their home communities. Some informants think that the poorest teachers, who are invariably assigned to the early primary grades, will not be able to secure similar jobs at home. Training, in fact, could give these teachers some credibility in their communities, without appreciably improving their skills.

a. Radio and Audio-cassettes

UNICEF should investigate and perhaps try on a pilot basis the use of radio and audio-cassettes for teacher-training. In addition to considering the BBC, some investigation of the possible use of Pakistani Pushto radio should be made. Currently, there are three stations broadcasting in a mix of Pushto and Urdu from D.I. Khan, Quetta and Peshawar. These stations cover the news and play music. If they broadcast education programs, they do so only rarely. This could be a mechanism for reaching Pakistani and Afghan teachers. The topics

selected could be chosen to serve both. The accent should probably be on the first grade and it should be timed with the start of the school year, if possible. This is in April in Pakistan, but almost all schools in Afghanistan would also be in session at this time. Religious topics should be included in any series both because religious teaching could probably be improved and because it will help gain credibility. Programs could be pre-tested in Commissionerate or other schools on this side of the border. Audio-cassettes, if found feasible, could repeat and build on the program. Distribution among refugee teachers would be relatively easy. It would be more complicated inside Afghanistan, but if NGOs liked the series and were consulted in the production, they would perhaps be ready to provide cassettes along with other supplies, or through their monitors and teacher trainers. Such a radio program could conceivably be used to gain credibility for education as a whole and to give parents greater understanding of how children learn. If UNICEF is simultaneously disseminating health education messages via the BBC services, it might be possible to support this by coordinating the topics of the teacher training broadcasts.

At such a time as Kabul becomes liberated, it may be possible to use the national radio station. There are a number of transmitters placed around the country, and at least some of these remain operational. Some money would probably have to be invested into repair and maintenance of the equipment.

b. In-service Training

In-Service training should be a greater priority than pre-service training. The majority of teachers teaching seem to be untrained, and they are likely to remain teachers in the absence of other opportunities. Although the need for additional teachers in probably there, it is not clear how many more could be absorbed. Of course, if properly trained teachers become available, communities may decide to replace their less well trained ones.

UNICEF should consider funding the training of teachers, and where possible and appropriate provide technical assistance for the preparation of the training program, or for program improvement. The emphasis should be on in-service training of teachers in the first three primary grades, since enrollments are higher in these grades. See Table IV.3 for an indication of the drop-out rate in NGO-supported schools.

c. Pre-Service Training

UNICEF should consider funding pre-service training for areas where the need is demonstrably clear. This included provinces

where it is difficult to find those with the minimal qualification necessary for teaching, such as Paktia, Paktika, and Helmand. However, there must be sufficient secondary or middle school candidates to feed into such a program. It might make most sense to have such institutes attached to secondary schools and to have students in the tenth, eleventh or twelfth grades follow a special track for primary school teacher training. Selection should be carefully done to ensure a mix of students from different provinces. Such institutes probably should provide in-service training as well to maximize their value.

d. Evaluation

There appears to have been very little substantive evaluation of teacher training programs so it is difficult to assess effectiveness. UNICEF could assist in this area by funding evaluations and should be cautious about funding existing refugee teacher training programs in the absence of such evaluations.

e. Teachers' Guides

UNICEF should consider supporting the development of teachers' guides for math and language arts for the first three grades.

3. Priority Number 3: Strengthen NGOs

o It is recommended that UNICEF fund NGOs to identify Afghans, with good primary education experience and training, who have emigrated abroad and bring them back as expatriate advisers, on a short or long term basis. For long term staff, this would need to be done sensitively so that existing Afghan staff do not resent the salary and benefits that are earned by someone who did not necessarily stay to make the sacrifices that others have made. The University of Nebraska recently published a biographic guide to Afghan technocrats (primarily residing in the U.S.) that could help identify needed experts. A larger guide to Afghan technocrats is being funded by U.S.A.I.D. and compiled by the Intergovernmental Committee on Migration, based in Geneva.

o UNICEF should also consider funding short-term expatriate or Afghan consultants to conduct workshops to improve the skills of NGOs' existing Afghan staff. Areas include curriculum development for specific subjects in the primary grades, such as language arts, and for teacher training, materials development for the primary grades and for teacher training, visual aids preparation, training of master trainers, and training of

teachers. Consultants could also be funded to work individually with an NGO in these or other areas.

o A further possibility would be to provide short-term training of no more than two to three months in duration abroad for Afghan educators attached to these NGOs. A number of them are proficient in a Western language. This is a more expensive and probably less cost-effective option than organizing in-service training in Pakistan, but there are instances when it could be beneficial for senior Afghan staff. Longer-term training abroad is not recommended since most organizations cannot afford to lose their few Afghan program managers and educators for any length of time.

4. Priority Number 4: Improvement in Written Materials for Primary School Children

As noted, this is a very sensitive area. There is interest in improvement, and two organizations, the AEC and ECA, have recently made revisions in many of their texts. Probably, improvement will have to come via training for those already involved in producing materials. However, there are some areas in which UNICEF assistance might be possible and beneficial.

o Development of additional visual aids for those materials that currently exist, with guides for teachers in how to use the materials

o Development of student workbooks for language arts and math for the first three grades to supplement existing textbooks. These should provide exercises that are not included in any significant fashion in most of the existing textbooks.

o Development/improvement of health education materials. These currently exist for 4th through 6th and 8th grade. Particular attention should be paid to materials for grades 1-3, since many students (and girls in particular) do not make it past the third grade. UNICEF is already sponsering this through IRC, but some effort will have to be devoted to incorporating the results into different curricula, or perhaps to adapting them to different areas.

o The ECA/UNO project is currently contemplating the development of mine awareness materials for children in the party schools. If this material is judged useful, perhaps UNICEF could play a role in extending the use to other schools. Emphasis should be on reaching children from areas that are known to be extensively mined.

5. Priority Number 5: Support for School Running Costs

o Most communities do not appear to have adequate resources to fund schools of any quality. The reconstruction of housing, rural infrastructure and agriculture will consume the bulk of community resources for the forseeable future. If primary schooling is to be provided on any meaningful scale, donors will have to pick up at least some of the running costs. Donor assistance for covering recurrent costs will be a vital support, perhaps decreasing over time as communities get back on their feet. Certainly, for the next couple of years, the more donor support available to cover salaries and materials, the more schools there will be. Some priority should be given to heavily destroyed areas and areas that have traditionally been underserved, provided that it is possible to reach and monitor schools in these areas, and there is cooperation and interest on the part of local communities.

o UNICEF could consider giving priority to funding girls' schools since there will be less community interest in these and since resources may not exist to establish separate girls' schools. The AEC is contemplating offering to fund girls' schools in areas where they fund other schools but where enrollments might be too small normally to justify the payment of teachers' salaries and the additional administrative and supervisory work. While this may increase female enrollment, it may also not be very cost-effective.

o UNICEF should consider funding schools only through those NGOs or organizations substantively engaged in primary education. Those NGOs should be providing teacher training and should conduct careful monitoring of the schools they support.

6. Priority Number 6: Assistance with Physical Facilities

UNICEF could look into funding the provision of tent and tarp classrooms, where this is merited by enrollment figures and numbers of classes. This is a relatively inexpensive way of providing shelter for a school and it is one that is frequently used in the camps. It is more appropriate for warmer climates than colder ones, but schools in the colder areas go on vacation for the three coldest months of the winter. One tent would be needed per class, or per teacher. Cash-for-work programs could be used to build some middle and secondary schools, and perhaps also to repair primary school buildings that would take relatively little effort and material to become usable again. Priority for the latter should go to colder climates.

One Swiss group that has put up tent and tarp classrooms in the

camps estimates that it costs 12,400 Rs. per four class school. This includes funding for digging a 1.5 meter pit, construction of two slab latrines, the tents with plastic and tarps for the floor, and construction of a mud wall around the school. Of course, transportation costs for the tents and tarps to areas inside Afghanistan would have to be added to the cost. Other materials would be available locally, and construction costs would be cheaper. Interested communities could also be asked to provide some volunteer labor in digging the pits and building the mud wall, and this would reduce the cost. Of course, a different configuration could also be used. The mud wall may not be necessary in a village setting, and in many cases it may be possible to omit the latrines. The provision of a separate latrine for girls is something that could help female enrollment. The cost of the tents and tarps alone is 1600 Rs.

B. Madrasas or Qu'ran Schools

Parents are more willing to enroll their daughters in religious schools. Increasing the number of these schools and improving their quality is probably the best way to gain acceptance of the idea of sending girls to an institution for some education. Over time, experience with Qur'anic schools might eventually lead to increased willingness to send girls to secular primary schools.

UNICEF should consider funding teacher training for these schools and also providing support for running costs, when large numbers of girls are enrolled and subjects such as health education, child care and literacy are taught.

It is recommended that UNICEF fund groups with secular and Qu'ranic girls schools in Pakistan to incorporate health education and child care messages into the program on a pilot basis. If acceptable to parents and successful, UNICEF could fund the expansion to schools in the camps and inside Afghanistan. There may be more girls enrolled in the camps than inside the country so it could be useful to reach these children while they are in Pakistan. If these materials use Qu'ranic injunctions and the Hadith, or saying from the Prophet, to support the encouraged behavior, they could be very effective. ISRA and Muslim Aid are two groups with large numbers of Afghan girls enrolled in both primary schools and Qu'ranic schools in Pakistan, and one or both might be interested in experimenting with such a program.

C. Literacy and Vocational Training for Youths

There are children and teenagers who have not had any opportunity

for education or who have failed to learn much in school. UNICEF should consider funding programs that provide an alternative for these children. There are NGOs currently involved in literacy training and the ECA has produced materials relevant to Afghans. Literacy education needs to be accompanied by or done through some kind of vocational training to make it attractive. One of the advantages to working in youth literacy might be that it can be a short program geared to a specific product, and so could be more cost-effective than primary education, and that it avoides at least some of the curriculum/content sensitivites of formal primary education.

o UNICEF should conduct an assessment of NGOs currently providing literacy training and literacy cum vocational training for Afghans. All such efforts are currently provided for refugees and most of them appear to be oriented toward adults. Such an assessment should produce more useful and detailed recommendations. Literacy training was outside the scope of this consultant's work.

o UNICEF should consider funding a pilot project to attach a literacy component to NGO-supported schools inside Afghanistan. This should be open to older children and youths. Accompanying the literacy should be some training in agriculture, such as training in farm management and record keeping, the use of fertilizer and pesticides, horticulture where important, repair of farm equipment, and the like. Such a pilot should initially be tried in an area where an NGO (either the same or a different NGO) has an agricultural development scheme with staff in place. Such a scheme would mean that resources to improve agriculture are being made available. It is also possible that the staff could help with the agriculture training. This would require the development of materials for agriculture education, and these might need to be area-specific. It would also require training a teacher for literacy and the agriculture component. It is not recommended that such a pilot be tried in Pakistan because there is no possibility for practical experience in farming.

D. Other Non-Traditional Approaches to Educating Children

Given the strong demand for religious education, little space is left in most school timetables for the early grades for learning about other subjects of utility. In addition, the quality of traditional schools will only improve slowly, as the human resource base develops and as donor funding is available. In the interim, UNICEF may also wish to look to other channels to try to convey important messages to children. Radio is one possible channel. Health messages aimed at adults could be supplemented and reinforced with messages on the same subject aimed at children. The limitation here will not be programming - the possibilities are virtually limitless - the problem will be air

time. An Afghan Sesame Street, designed for radio, could be very helpful to children. If air time can be acquired during the day, radio programs can even be used in the schools, to supplement the teaching. Posters, booklets and/or cassette tapes could support radio programs but would probably not be sufficient in themselves.

APPENDIX I

NAMES AND ADDRESSES

OF

NGOS WORKING IN PRIMARY EDUCATION

FOR AFGHANS

1. L'ACTION INTERNATIONALE CONTRA LA FAIM
Gilani Road
P.O. Box 319
Quetta

tel. 73132

Director: Mr. Michel La Pechoux
Health Education/Sanitation Director: Christian Zuanon

2. AFGANISTAN EDUCATION COMMITTEE
15A Gulmohar Lane
University Town, Peshawar
(P.O. Box 876)

tel. 41247

Director: Mr. Sven Johnsson

3. AFRANE
The White House
2 Park Lane
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42320

Director: Mr. Vincent Guy

4. AUSTRIAN RELIEF COMMITTEE
80 D Park Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42592/42584

Director: Mr. Nasim Jawad

over time. Some of those working in primary education, and particularly those working with refugees, report that some communities show an increased regard for education. This could partly be explained by pre-existing demand for schooling that could not be met under war-time circumstances. However, many commanders and mujahideen have had experience mounting military campaigns and using sophisticated weapons. Accordingly, they may be more inclined to recognize the value of an education that goes beyong religious training. The terrible dislocations of this war have broadened the horizons of many by exposing them to a wider range of people and circumstances, and some of these may also now be more open to the teaching of a wider range of subjects. They understand that Afghanistan has come into brutal contact with the modern world and that it may be very difficult for Afghans to isolate themselves in their villages after liberation.

Others engaged in supporting primary education note that suspicion of education is great, since the education system is blamed for producing Afghan communists, thereby leading to the ruin of the country. Those in the camps also realize that education has not necessarily proved to be helpful to refugees in finding jobs, so many parents continue to be sceptical of its value. In many farming communities, literacy continues to be viewed as largely irrelevant to community and family needs.
To some extent, changes in attitude toward more secular education will be driven by economic change. As the means for paying for certain skills is generated, community attitudes toward the kind of education that produces those skills will improve. One Afghan educator also pointed out that communities will be more open to the teaching of secular subjects once an Islamic government is in power, because they will trust that government to make decisions according to the dictates of the religion.

Afghans feel very strongly about what is taught to their children. They resent the attempt of the Kabul regime to use schools to indoctrinate children. One initial reason the Kabul regime met with so much hostility in the countryside was their forced imposition of educational reforms. Their decrease in emphasis on religion in the curriculum was one "reform" that was decidedly unpopular.

1. Religious Education

The interest in giving children a firm grounding in Islam is very strong among almost all sections of the community. This is not surprising. Afghanistan was a very traditional agrarian society, and the practice of Islam had great day-to-day importance. Islamic subjects were traditionally a large part of the primary school curriculum, while many parents who sought an education for their children chose religious schools. In addition, Afghan culture and way of life have been seriously threatened by this decade-long war. Islam is at the root of that culture. In the

5. BRITISH PAKISTAN MODEL SCHOOL
6-9/380A Shara-e-Gulistan
Quetta

tel. 75773

Director: Ms. Deborah Turrell

6. EXPERIMENT IN INTERNATIONAL LIVING
P.O. Box 363
Sattelite Town, Quetta

tel. 43447

General Director: Mr. Jan Karpowitz
Education Project Manager: Mr. Robert Fuderich

7. GERMAN AFGHANISTAN FOUNDATION
55 B S. J. Afghani Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 43257

Director: Mr. A. R. Ghafoori

8. INTERNATIONAL RESCUE COMMITTEE

Main Office:
41 D S. Abdul Qayyum Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 41485, 41247

Director: Mr. Tom Yates

Development Center for Education:
18 Chinar Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 40189

Director: Ms. Margaret Segal

9. ISLAMIC RELIEF AGENCY
17 Chinar Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42245

Director: Dr. Abdul Rahman Ahmed
Education Director: Mr. Ahmad Ali Beasawi

10. MEDICINS SANS FRONTIERES
The White House
2 Park Lane
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42320

Director: Dr. Robert Saleon-Terras

11. MUSLIM AID
75 A Abdara Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 43203

Director: Dr. Muhammed Salim
Deputy Director: Mr. Imad Saleem

12. NORWEGIAN COMMITTEE FOR AFGHANISTAN
12 Gulmohar Lane
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42517

Director: Mr. Arne Strand
Education Director: Ms. Hilde Tradin

13. PAK-GERMAN BAS-ED PROJECT
7 Gulmohar Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 40989

Director: Mr. Wilhelm Schuldt
NB: This is a joint project of the Governments of Pakistan

and West Germany.

14. SOLIDARITE AFGHANISTAN (FRANCE)
Formerly Guilde du Raide
The White House
2 Park Lane
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42030

Director: Mr. Patrick Brizay

15. SOS/PG-SOLIDARITE AFGHANISTAN (BELGIUM)
3 Canal Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 42319 or 50892 (Hayatabad Training Center)

Director: Dr. Fernand Lohisse

16. SWISS AFGHANISTAN PROJECT ASSOCIATION
CH-2555 Brugg
Switzerland

tel. 032-53-20-53

Director: Dr. Theo Locher

17. UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA AT OMAHA
35 F/A Kushal Khan Khattak Road
University Town, Peshawar

tel. 44536

Director: Dr. Gerald Boardman

absence of other broadly acceptable ideologies, Islam has also become a major unifying principal in a country made up of competing ethnic and tribal groups. Religious authorities have increased their influence and they support comprehensive training in religious subjects, as do practically all parents. Some are also opposed to or have reservations about the need for certain secular subjects. As one example, one group working in the camps notes that some religious authorities try to discourage parents from sending their children to schools where the English language is taught, on the theory that English is the language of "kaffirs," or unbelievers.

Religious schools (madrasas) remain a popular (and in many cases the only) alternative to more secular education. With the loss of many teachers, mullahs and mawlawis may be providing a greater share of the education inside Afghanistan than they did before the war. In addition, there is great respect for traditional religious authorities who have often assumed important positions of leadership in the Resistence. Qur'anic schools customarily teach only religious subjects and arithmetic in the lower grades. They do not teach Dari or Pushto, so children who attend them gain no knowledge of reading and writing in their own language. While Arabic is to some extent taught, the main emphasis is on reading and reciting the Qu'ran with correct pronunciation. The traditional role of madrasas, at least for the students who attend them for any length of time, is to produce religious dignitaries or authorities. Students study standard ancient texts and commentaries. The curriculum is not geared to producing students who can understand and use modern technologies and methodologies to their country's benefit. Some NGOs are working with religious schools, trying to add Pushto, science and more math, and improve teaching skills.

What is studied in both regligious and elementary schools under the rubric of religion does go beyond dogma and theology. It includes customs, social norms, hygiene, family responsibilities, law, and history. The study of religion, in the Afghan context, teaches children how to live in their society. These are very important subjects and, when drop out rates are high and attendance poor, one must ask what a reasonable set of educational objectives is for the first three years of schools. Perhaps an introduction to culture and religion, along with a slight acquaintance with reading, writing and arithmetic is all that should be expected given current circumstances and attitudes.

2. The Jihad

Waging war against infidels is a religious duty for Muslims. The war against the Kabul regime and its Soviet allies is considered by Afghans and most other Muslims to be a Jihad or Holy War.

Afghans now wish to have great emphasis placed on the Jihad in all subject matters, where possible. One developer of some health education materials, for example, was told to re-examine his materials in light of the Jihad and make appropriate changes. The preoccupation is understandable. This is a struggle in which virtually the entire population of the country has been involved, and it has precluded a normal existance for many, including children. Afghan children need to learn about the sad history of their country over the last ten years and the sacrifices that the Afghan people have made, but they are surrounded every day by evidence of this tragedy and one may wonder if it is good for them to hear it, day-in and day-out, in school. Given its immediacy, however, schools cannot and should not ignore it. The issue is one of balance, and how much is useful without becoming deleterious.

4. Attendance and Attrition

While there is some interest in education, there are many other things, both in the camps and in Afghan villages, that interfere with a child attending school regularly. Attendance generally is poor, particularly for females, and the attrition rate high, although there are schools that are exceptions. Parents often have an economic need for their their children's labor, and they cannot afford to sacrifice this contribution so that their children can routinely attend school. In Commissionerate schools in NWFP, as an example, almost one-half the first grade boys do not go on to second grade, and by fourth grade only about one-quarter of those original first graders are still in school. For girls, the drop out rates in the early primary grades are higher. Slightly less than half the first graders go on to second grade, only one quarter are enrolled in the third grade and only about 15% in the fourth grade. These statistics would probably not be significantly different for party schools or for many schools inside Afghanistan. To some extent, poor attendance and high drop out rates are a realistic response to the low quality of the schools and teaching. When the physical facility is inadequate; teaching equipment, teachers and books are in scarce supply; chanting and repetition are the preferred methods, and teacher knowledge is often inadequate, then student and parental uninterest is not surprising.

5. Female Education

Education is more valued for boys than for girls. Parents would prefer to have all-girls' schools with female teachers but some who value education are willing to tolerate girls' classes with male teachers for the first few years. It is important, however, to have older males who are respected in the community as the teachers. There appears to be substantially less openess with

CONFIDENTIAL

INTERNATIONAL RESCUE COMMITTEE

BACKGROUND

In 1985, the IRC established an Educational Development Center to promote education for Afghans. An initial needs assessment indicated that while there were several groups supporting primary education, no one was supporting secondary education. The IRC decided to concentrate first in this area, in the belief that secondary education was key to producing future generations of Afghan technicians.

The Center has initiated several different projects, most of which serve secondary or post-secondary school students. It has produced 17 textbooks in science and math for secondary school. It also set up a science-oriented high school for Afghan boys and supports six other refugee schools (5 Inter-Party Schools and the Lycee Malalai) that run through the twelfth grade. The English Language Training Program, one of the first programs to be set up, began in 1985. The Center also has organized a literacy and vocational training program for youths in the Hungu-Thal camps.

In addition to these programs, the Center since 1987 set up six different projects offering higher education to Afghans. These programs range from construction engineering to journalism to medical translation.

The Center, in recent months, has begun to provide more support to primary education in refugee camps in the tribal agencies. In addition, IRC's Health Education Resource Center (HERC) is developing health education materials for the primary school level. These projects will be discussed in turn.

STAFFING

The Educational Development Center has a number of expatriate staff, hired usually on six month to one year contracts, involved in its various programs. Generally staff stay longer than this. The Director of the Center, Ms. Margaret Segal, has experience developing ESL materials and textbooks. The Director of the Community Education Program, Ms. Toc Dunlap, is an experienced educator who ran an alternative high school for drop outs and delinquints in the U.S. There is also an expatriate who serves as Assistant Coordinator in the Interparty School program. There are two Afghan staff concerned with curriculum and textbook development but they work primarily at the middle and secondary school level. Subordinate staff are mentioned within the context of each program.

THE COMMUNITY EDUCATION PROGRAM

The objective of this program, which began this summer, is to provide books and supplies to schools that had few sources of support. IRC solicited and obtained funding based on requests that had been made for assistance from schools in the Hungu-Thal area. There are two parts to this program:

1) support for tanzeem schools

2) support for Talamat-e-Diniyas, or first grade classes held in private homes

The objective of both parts is to get books and supplies to as many school children as possible. Included are schools in North and South Waziristan, Kohat and Kurram Agencies.

With respect to the first part, IRC visited the Education Cells of the tanzeems and asked them if they would like this support for their schools in these areas. The education staffs were told that IRC would supply the books of their choice, as well as a package of stationary and materials. Four parties requested support and asked IRC to supply the ECA/University of Nebraska books. Until this summer, ECA/UNO was not permitted to supply these books in the camps. Requests for support have now exceeded funding for this program.

As on 1 December, IRC has delivered books and supplies to ninety schools. Seven of these schools are secondary schools. The rest are primary schools. Total enrollments are claimed to be around 14,000 but this figure may be inflated. Staff go out and find the schools and complete a questionnaire on each one. Student enrollment is considered to be those attending on the day the team visits, plus some extra. ECA/UNO books are distributed for grades one through four, and Alliance or party books are used for the higher grades. IRC math and science books are distributed to secondary school students.

Some of the parties did not communicate the details of the arrangement they had made with IRC to their schools, so the IRC team's first visit was in several cases a surprise. This led to some suspicion in refugee communities about IRC's objectives. Suspicion was directed, in particular, to the choice of books. Many schools said that their first need was for religious books, and some said that they would only take the secular books if the religious ones they wanted were provided. In addition, some of the schools on the tanzeem lists were religious schools, and they only wanted religious books. Religious books were already included in the IRC package, but these were contemporary religious books, and school officials wanted the standard texts that they had experience using. Unfortunately, these older texts, including the Holy Qu'ran, are very expensive, and can increase the book and materials cost per student by 50-100%. IRC is, however, trying to provide at least some of these books and

has turned to one of the Muslim aid agencies for assistance. IRC plans to set up a committee of mullahs in these communities to set the religious books so that in future IRC has a fixed package that it will offer schools. It will then be able estimate expenditures.

Included in this assistance is payment of salaries for twenty teachers of each party. The current director of this project does not want to do this next year. It is too small a contribution and takes too much staff time to manage, but it had already been promised for this year. Those teachers who are designated as recipients of an IRC salary will have to pass a test geared to the sixth grade level.

Not all the schools included in this program are tanzeem schools. There are a few community-run schools, including one with 400 students, now getting IRC support.

The second part of this program are the home-based Talamat-e-Diniyas or first grade classes organized primarily for girls, although a few boys do attend. IRC has funding to support 75 of these and currently has received around 80 requests. As of 1 December, sixteen such classes are functioning. In all these classes, the majority of students are girls. These are the only sorts of schools in the Hungu-Thal area enrolling girls, with the exception of perhaps one party school which has girls in one class. These classes are currently using the old Alliance books. Teachers are selected by the community, and new ones being hired must pass a test geared to the sixth grade level. Some will be mullahs, because of community sensitivities in teaching girls. They teach four hours a day and receive a salary, paid by IRC, of 400 Rs. per month. Boys will be permitted to attend if a regular school is at an unreasonable distance from their homes - or if it is clear that their parents will not let them attend a Commissionerate or other neighboring school, for whatever reason. IRC does not want to draw students already enrolled in school.

IRC does not yet know what will happen with the Talamat-e-diniyas next year, since they do not yet know how many refugees might return to Afghanistan in the spring. The obvious direction would be to add a second grade in those schools that still have students enrolled. Funding would have to be solicited for this.

TEACHER TRAINING FOR THE COMMUNITY EDUCATION PROGRAM

Staff comment that many if not most of these teachers are at ground zero. They do not know how to take attendance and get the class quiet, for example. They also have no idea in the first grade how to begin to teach reading. IRC is concentrating, at least initially, on training teachers in the Talamat-e-diniyas.

IRC staff chose five teachers with primary school experience to act as trainers, but they have a budget for seven. They are

regard to mixed classes. In areas where there are security concerns, both in the camps and in Afghanistan, parents are less willing to let a daughter walk any distance to school than a son. It seems clear that more girls would be enrolled if there were separate schools with female teachers for them. Female attendance is probably lower than that of boys, because they may be needed more in the house. Commissionerate Education Cell staff note that there are always fewer female students present after the morning recess than before it, because the girls must go home to help their mothers. This makes it difficult for a teacher to prepare lessons. For which students does she do so?

6. Outside Support for Education

Involvement in education in general and primary education in particular is fraught with difficulty for all foreigners but probably in particular for Westerners. This is at least partly because there was considerable Soviet and Western involvement in Afghan education before the war. Each is suspected of having a mind-set or ideology that it wants to impose on Afghan children. The level of zenophobia is high, and some Afghans inevitably will suspect that any visible Western assistance in education is designed to produce Christians or non-believing, "imitation" Westerners. This may be more true of the refugees camps, where such assistance is more visible and where religious authorities are particularly influential. Western support for education inside Afghanistan is more diffused and therefore less obvious. One interesting example that highlights this point comes from the International Rescue Committee's (IRC) experience in camps in Kurram, Waziristan and Kohat agencies. IRC provides books and supplies to tanzeem-run schools in these camps. The Education Cell of each of the involved tanzeems told IRC what books it wanted its schools to receive, and IRC then went out and purchased those books. Unfortunately, the tanzeems did not then communicate their choice of books to their schools or that IRC would be providing support. When IRC turned up at the schools with the books (written by the Education Center for the Alliance) which included contemporary religious books, they were sometimes met with hostility and were told that the school's first preference was to have the old-fashioned standard Farsi and Arabic religious texts. In some schools, IRC staff were told that the school would only accept the "IRC books" if the others were provided along with them. IRC agreed to provide the desired religious texts, despite the facts that some of them were very expensive and there was no budget for them, but explained that it would take three weeks to purchase and deliver such books. Thereafter, IRC was accused of trying to force "their" books on the schools, of unwillingness to provide the desired religious books, and of trying to distribute Pushto bibles. These rumours were eventually quieted, with some effort on the part of IRC staff and the tanzeems whose schools were being supplied.

either university graduates or 14th class graduates. They were selected through a process of interviewing to see what they knew, in particular about pedagogy, and they gave sample lessons. All ran a student-centered class. Three attended the two week Pak-German teacher-training seminar in August.

Training for teachers in the Talamat-e-Diniyas began in late November. They are being trained for four hours per day over a one week period. Staff admit that they cannot hope to accomplish very much in this period, but consider it a start, and regard it as better than nothing. They will try to introduce some basic principles, such as the idea of preparing lesson plans, and some better methods for teaching reading, writing and arithmetic. The teachers will give practice lessons. They will receive the ECA/ONU packet of visual aids and will receive some training in how to use them. Following this training, IRC staff plan to organize ad hoc seminars in the teaching of particular subjects.

With respect to monitoring, the teacher-trainers will also function as monitors. They will visit the party and talamat-e-diniya schools, and will also check on those teachers receiving a salary from IRC.

THE INTER-PARTY SCHOOL PROGRAM

This program supports five primary/secondary schools which are managed by different parties; two schools belong to Mahaz, one to Jebha and two to Harakat. Two schools are located in Peshawar, one in Bajaur, one in Hungu and one in Haripur. These are Pushto-medium schools, although one of the schools uses Dari in some classes as well as Pushto. A total of 2,022 students are enrolled in grades one through six. The U.S. State Department's Office of Refugee Affairs pressed IRC to take over this schools from another agency. IRC assumed support in 1987 and is advised by a Board that included four educators nominated by IRC and approved by the three parties, and one representative each from the three parties. All candidates for teaching posts must pass an examination prior to employment. Teachers are paid 1000-1200 Rs per month regardless of the grade they teach.

IRC has two full time Afghan monitors who visit these schools once or twice per month check on attendance and use of the supplies and equipment. They also review the teaching and try to help the teachers improve their techniques. They do this through giving feedback and by demonstrating techniques to the teacher. They have teaching and teacher training experience and were given short-term training in monitoring. A primary education specialist was hired last year to help with this program but he has now been lent to the community education program. He may eventually work with both these programs. He ran a two week workshop for about thirty of the teachers in these five schools this summer.

ADDITIONAL SUPPORT FOR SCHOOLS

IRC receives requests from various groups for support for schools. Funds permitting, they do give books and supplies to other schools in NWFP. Most of these are not party schools. IRC pays no salaries and checks on actual attendance before drawing up a list of requirements. Monitors then spot-check to make sure that the school is not drawing the same support from elsewhere.

HEALTH EDUCATION

The Health Education Resources Center (HERC) was established in 1986 to collect materials related to health and to develop education materials directed at refugees. This past summer, HERC received a one-year grant from UNICEF to develop health education materials for primary and middle school. It currently is concentrating on materials for grades one through four for refugee children, and is hoping to have these incorporated as a part of language arts teaching in different curricula. These materials would be treated as supplementary to the Dari and Pushto primers already in use in schools. Staff are surveying teacher, headmaster and tanzeem interests in health education in order to come up with acceptable materials that will be used. They are also sharing preliminary ideas for lessons. In addition, they are testing drawings with children to see what sorts of pictures excite the children's interest and what sorts of pictoral representations they understand. Once grade 4 materials are finished, HERC will work on messages for grades 5 through 8.

Staff are developing one lesson per week, and these lessons take the form of stories illustrating simple health education points, such as keeping flies off food, cutting finger nails, eating vegetables and fruit and the like. These lessons will probably be produced in booklet form, with pictures and simple reading texts. Staff are also working on word games.

Staff assigned to this project include Ms. Cathy O'Brien, a health educator, as project manager; Dr. Aksir, a physician with public health experience; Prof. Ishaq, an educator who is preparing the lessons; Ms. Jean Ryan, an artist; and two Afghan artists who also undertake other work for HERC.

Once developed, HERC will share these with the tanzeems and other community authorities to gain approval. Then they will test them and make necessary revisions to improve impact. They have not yet decided in which schools the materials will be tested but expect to do so at Hungu and perhaps in Chitral, in cooperation with other agencies. Once a final set of materials for the first few grades is obtained, they will plan teacher training to introduce the materials. At the end of this process, they hope to focus on the adaptation of these materials for schools in

Afghanistan and also for Pakistani Pathan children in NWFP.

FUTURE PLANS

Refugees living in the Hungu-Thal areas, where IRC is most heavily involved, are largely from Paktia, Logar and Nangarhar. As they return, IRC would like to return with them. If refugees begin to return next spring, at least initially, IRC would send books and supplies with them Staff intend to be active in the education sector in these provinces. IRC is interested in acting as the overall coordinator for groups working in education in these border areas. The group has sent a survey team to Paktia to assess overall reconstruction needs.

Thomas D Gouttierre Director-IRC 12/10/84

Signature Position Date

However, charges of selling out to the Americans continue to be levelled from time to time at the program's Afghan staff.

III. PRIMARY EDUCATION FOR REFUGEES

A. Overview

The Government of Pakistan's Commissionerate for Afghan Refugees (CAR) is technically responsible for all schools in the camps. Many tanzeems or political parties, however, have organized their own schools, and they are more or less free to do so. There are more party schools in the North West Frontiern Province (NWFP) than in Baluchistan. This reflects the Peshawar-base of the tanzeems and perhaps also the higher level of services available to refugees in NWFP.

In general, refugee children attending school must make do with inadequate physical facilities, no equipment, shortages of books and materials, large classes in the lower grades, an inadequate number of teachers and poor instruction. One NGO working in the camps notes that roughly 90% of the teachers in the tanzeem schools they are supporting are brand new teachers who are totally lost in the classroom. The teachers often do not even have a clear idea of how to take attendance and get the attention of the students. The teaching of beginning language arts seems particularly weak. Many informants noted that the weakest teachers are generally assigned to the first three grades. This is unfortunate but not atypical of other countries.

Impressions of those working in the camps suggest that each group, the Commissionerate and the parties, are providing roughly half the education available to Afghan refugee children. In addition, there are some private or community-organized schools. There are also religious schools, some of which are supported by the political parties or tanzeems. The Commissionerate does not run any Dari language medium schools, so parents wanting children literate in their mother tongue must seek out party or private schools. UNHCR staff believe that except for some small scattered populations of unregistered refugees in remote areas, most children whose parents want them to attend primary school have an opportunity to do so. This may be true to some extent but many parents probably keep their children home because they cannot obtain for them the kind of education they would like.

Many parents in the camps would prefer to have "village" schools that include only their own extended family, clan or social group. They do not want their children taught by an unknown outsider. This is particularly true for girls' schools. Commissionerate Education Cell staff in Baluchistan note that

they must factor this into the hiring of new teachers. IRC is now trying to meet this demand, at least with respect to girls, by funding first grade classes in homes. Muslim Aid and ISRA fund Qu'ran centers, which enroll primarily girls, and are acceptable because the teachers are respected mullahs or their wives.

There is, as noted, unmet demand for quality education, since many if not most of the private and party schools have few resources. In some schools, for example, the children in one class will have a mix of different textbooks concerning the same subject, because the school has had to take whatever textbooks were donated. In addition, class size, particularly in the early grades, is very large in many schools, with 60 - 90 pupils in one class. There are also more classes than teachers employed so that one teacher must look after more than one class. More teachers are needed, and there are unemployed Afghan teachers unable to find teaching positions, but the funds do not exist to employ them.

One problem in refugees schools is that first graders can range in age from 2 to 7 years old. This is particularly the case with girls' schools where the 6 year old is responsible for the 3 year old, while the mother concerns herself with a younger child at home. This is also sometimes a problem in higher elementary grades. In some schools, headmasters do not feel that they can send these smaller children home. There is a real need for kindergarten classes. There often is a wide mix of ages in other grades as well, the result of children not having consistent access to education.

There are some girls' schools but only a very few female teachers currently teaching in Baluchistan. There are a number of girls' schools in Peshawar district and a few in other NWFP camps. There are currently about 80 Afghan female teachers teaching in the Peshawar-area schools, and a smaller number teaching in NWFP camps. Roughly 30% of these women were teachers before the war. There are unemployed female teachers who would like to teach but do not, perhaps because they cannot travel to the camps. One UNICEF consultant, however, currently surveying skilled Afghan women, has found experienced Afghan female teachers who are living in many of the camps and would like to teach. About 100 female Pakistani teachers are employed in the Commissionerate schools.

Many observors have noted that competition between schools can be a problem, and that enrollments can decline and increase depending on what extras are being handed out. Parents value the uniforms and schoolbags given to students in the Commissionerate schools, while the party schools sometimes offer a small cash gratuity to attract students. In addition, students who fail the final exams in one school sometimes enroll in the next grade in

is needed. This is one reason that headmasters and local education representatives should also be targets of training programs. They can in turn, with sufficinet preparation, help train teachers.

UNICEF should consider trying to strengthen the NGO capacity to channel resources to primary education in part by strengthening their Afghan staff. This could be accomplished via short-term training in Pakistan or abroad, or through consultants (emigre Afghan or otherwise) to work with NGOs on specific tasks. Some NGOs are also very thinly staffed with expatriate management personnel, and some lack staff with good technical skills in primary education.

Most communities do not have adequate resources to fund schools of any quality and will have other investment priorities. If primary education is to be organized on a scale in accordance with current demand, then donor assistance will be necessary to cover recurrent costs, perhaps decreasing over time as communities get back on their feet. UNICEF may want to consider funding school running costs, particularly for girls' schools, which will be even less of a community priority, and particularly when subjects of practical use, such as health education are taught. If UNICEF wishes to fund schools, it should do so only through those organizations which are substantively involved in primary education, are providing teacher training, and are conducting careful monitoring.

The construction of primary schools is not a priority, even though many schools are destroyed or so badly damaged as to be unusable. This would be a costly endeavor. Many schools now use the local mosque, and it is probably not unreasonable to ask the community to organize accommodation for a school. UNICEF could look into funding the provision of tent-and-tarp classrooms, where this is merited by enrollment figures. This is a relatively inexpensive way, frequently used in refugee camps, of providing shelter for a school. It is of course less suitable for cold climate areas.

UNICEF should consider funding pilot education programs which target older children and youths who either missed an opportunity to attend school or who failed to learn much while in school. Literacy training accompanied by or done through agriculture education could be one possibility that could prove attractive to communities and could prove more efficient than traditional primary education. It may also avoid some of the sensitivities of working with formal education. Some literacy training is currently being organized for refugees but most programs target adults. At least one set of materials relevant to Afghans has been produced. Such a pilot could be tried where there are NGOs working in education and agriculture. This would ensure that agriculture resources are coming into the area, and it is possible that local personnel on an agriculture project could help with agriculture education.

ACRONYMS

ACBAR	Agency Coordinating Body for Afghan Reconstruction
AEC	Afghanistan Education Committee
AICF	Action Internationale contra la Faim
ARC	Austrian Relief Committee
CAR	Commissionerate for Afghan Refugees
ECA	Education Center for Afghanistan
EIL	Experiment in International Living
GAF	German Afghanistan Foundation
GOP	Government of Pakistan
HERC	Health Education Resource Center, of IRC
IRC	International Rescue Committee
ISRA	Islamic Relief Agency
MSF	Medecins sans Frontieres
NCA	Norwegian Committee for Afghanistan
TTI	Teacher Training Institute
UNO	University of Nebraska

GLOSSARY OF TERMS

ACBAR	Coordinating body formed by several NGOs working with Afghans, either in Afghanistan or in the refugee campsin Pakistan
Alliance	Coalition formed by seven Afghan Sunni political parties based in Peshawar
Dari	The Afghan dialect of Farsi or Persian
Farsi	The Persian language
Islamiyat	Course title for the study of religion
Madrassa	Religious or mosque school
Mawlawi	A religious scholar
Mullah	Religious authority who teaches in a madrassa
Tanzeem	Afghan political party

I. METHODOLOGY

Based on the terms of reference and discussions with UNICEF and NGO staff, a questionnaire was developed. Rather than submit this lengthy questionnaire to each NGO and hope for timely and appropriate answers, the consultant used the questionnaire as a guide in interviewing. This questionnaire has been provided to UNICEF, as a separate Appendix C to this report. The questionnaire included some open-ended questions and many closed ones, the latter more suitable for programming on a data base. It went through a number of revisions, as the consultant gained a better understanding of the meaningful range of responses and as the number of groups involved in primary education multiplied well beyond what was originally anticipated. Mid-way through the consultancy, the need for a computerized data base was questionned by the consultant and discussed with UNICEF staff. Given the relatively limited number of groups and the restricted range of activities, as well as the security concerns of groups working cross-border, such a data base did not seem mandated at this time. Given the initiation of new activities, as available funding grows, maintenance of a computerized data base would necessitate considerable work, probably for very little benefit. The consultant also raised concerns about who the users of these data would be and to what purpose they would put them.

Extensive interviewing and document review was done with seventeen organizations working in primary education and teacher training in Peshawar and Quetta. Table I.1 lists those groups and their national affiliation, if relevant. For the larger groups, more than one staff person was interviewed. Some groups were not interested in reviewing their program with the consultant, but these were few in number. Interviews were held with UNHCR, which funds activities of some of these organizations, and the Education Cells of the Commissionerate for Afghan Refugees which is responsible for refugee schools. The consultant also attended meetings of the Basic Education Subcommittee of ACBAR, the NGO coordination group.

Syllabi and timetables were examined for teacher training courses and primary school. Individual books in four of the most used sets of textbooks for primary school students were reviewed and, in some cases, compared. In addition, Pak-German Bas-Ed materials for Pushto and math were examined. Materials for one teacher training course were also reviewed. Since the consultant reads Arabic and has studied some Dari, it was possible to

examine the Dari-language textbooks for grades one and two directly. For the higher primary grades, translation assistance was sought. Since the consultant was only interested in gaining a general sense of 1) how easy it might be for teachers and students to use these books and 2) what was taught to the students of each grade, and not in a close techincal evaluation of each set of books and their merits and demerits, not very much time was devoted to this. In addition, visual aids produced by different groups were reviewed.

The report is divided into two parts. The first part presents a general assessment of primary education and teacher training for Afghans and gives the consultant's recommendations. The second part includes profiles of each NGO working in this sector. It is requested that this second part be treated as confidential information and not be made publicly available. Particularly the groups working cross-border have legitimate security concerns.

TABLE I.1

LIST OF ORGANIZATIONS WHOSE ACTIVITIES WERE REVIEWED

Action Internationale Contra la Faim (France)
Afghanistan Education Committee (Sweden)
Afrane (France)
Austrian Relief Committee (Austria)
Education Center for Afghanistan/University of Nebraska (Afghan Alliance/U.S.)
Experiment in International Living (U.S.)
German Afghanistan Foundation (Germany)
International Rescue Committee (U.S.)
Islamic Relief Agency (Sudan)
Medecins sans Frontieres (France)
Muslim Aid
Norwegian Committee for Afghanistan (Norway)
Oxfam (U.K.)
Pak-German Bas-Ed (Pakistan-Germany)
Solidarite Afghanistan (France)
SOS/PG - Solidarite Afghanistan (Belgium)
Swiss Afghanistan Project Association (Switzerland)

ASSESSMENT OF CURRENT ACTIVITIES AND PRIORITIES

IN

PRIMARY EDUCATION AND TEACHER TRAINING

FOR AFGHANS

Dr. Lynn Carter
Consultant to UNICEF
Peshawar, December 1988

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TERMS OF REFERENCE

The overall purpose of this consultancy was to help UNICEF plan educational programes for cross-border operations and prepare refugees for their return. The consultant was requested to investigate the activities of those NGOs supporting primary education in Afghanistan and/or providing teacher training to refugee teachers on this side of the border. The information collected from each group was to include staffing, areas of expertise, scope of activities undertaken, materials developed and plans for future work. To make sense of these activites and to develop recommendations for program planning, the consultant needed to fit existing efforts into a cultural and political context, and so examined pre-war primary education, current attitudes toward education, constraints and issues involved in supporting this sector, priority needs, and strategies for the effective channelling of resources. The consultant was also asked to recommend short-term training for refugees that might support primary education inside Afghanistan after the return of these refugees.

Initially the consultant was requested to provide information on NGO activities in an indexed form suitable for computerization. The questionnaire developed in order to meet this requirment is included with this report . However, the TOR were later changed to omit this requirement (please see I. Methodology).

CURRENT STATUS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION

In general, Afghan children fortunate enough to attend school on either side of the border must contend with inadequate physical facilities, insufficient teaching materials and equipment, and inexperienced and poorly prepared teachers. This is a reflection largely of the limited resources (material and human) available to invest in educating Afghans. In addition, attitudes toward the value of secular education are indifferent and often negative, although there is some indication that this may be changing in some circles. To some extent, parental scepticism of the usefulness of book-learning results from the traditionally low quality of Afghan primary schools. Schools have however been used to indoctrinate children with ideas that parents consider inappropriate, so there is some deep-seated suspicion of secular education. The major objective that most parents have in sending their children to school is the acquisition of religious knowledge.

The current enrollment rate is impossible to determine but it is probably under 20% of eligible children on both sides of the border. It was 30% before the war. This decrease is not surprising given conditions of war prevailing in many parts of

the country, the lack of acceptable opportunities for schooling, and the impoverishment of the Afghan people. Among those children enrolled, attendance is often erratic and the drop out rate high. Very few of those enrolled in the first grade continue beyond second or third grade, so schools have at most two or three years to provide children with knowledge of value to them and their communities.

There are over twenty organizations involved in supporting basic education for Afghans. Some of these are partly or entirely interested in religious education. The activities of seventeen groups were reviewed for this study. All seventeen are engaged in supporting traditional formal primary education. The major innovation is the introduction of health education materials from grade four in some programs. Nine organizations currently work primarily with refugees and are variously engaged in supporting and/or managing schools, developing primary education materials and training teachers. Of these nine, one also supports primary schools cross-border, while others have plans to do so. Eight NGOs invest the bulk of their resources in cross-border activities, but some of these also support refugee schools in Pakistan. Of these eight, only three would identify primary education as their main sector of interest. For the others, it is one component of a varied program.

The style of working cross-border differs from group to group. At least one manages some of its schools directly, with personnel it has hired. Most work through local commanders, who are responsible for hiring teachers and overseeing the school(s), but some seek more involvement in school policy and administration than others. The major organizations involved in primary education insist that the schools they are funding follow a particular timetable and use specified textbooks. Many of the others do not show an interest in what is taught and are not very equipped to pursue quality issues.

A number of sets of primary school textbooks, partial or complete, have been written over the last ten years by those supporting the Resistance. There is a measure of competition between proponents of the various textbooks, and there are some differences in approach although many of the texts would appear to be relatively similar. Proper curriculum and materials development for the early grades is a serious gap, and there are few real Afghan primary education specialists to help fill it. One particular area of weakness is the teaching of language arts in the first three grades. These textbooks in particular could benefit from specialized expertise.

The bulk of the training provided to Afghan teachers in recent years has been provided in Pakistan to refugees. This has mostly consisted of in-service training, ranging in length from a couple of weeks to four months, while one organization has organized one year diploma courses at different sites in Pakistan. Teacher training is just beginning to be a focus for the cross-border

agencies, which are now trying to organize short-term training via mobile teams or through personnel based in an area. Most training programs of necessity place considerable emphasis on content. Improved pedagogical techniques will only be adopted slowly, over time, by teachers who are confortable with the information they are teaching.

Other constraints to working in this sector include the small pool of educated individuals from which to draw teachers, the fragmentation of power in liberated areas which requires different arrangements and highly individualized management, the lack of administrative structures with which to work in many communities, continued fighting, the difficulty of getting materials to and monitoring schools in areas distant from Peshawar (and for some groups from Quetta), and the limited absorbtive capacity of the NGOs providing assistance.

IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS

UNICEF should consider concentrating its resources on early primary education, when most students are enrolled and should try to make the teaching more effective and useful to the community. The concentration should be on basic literacy and numeracy, and the introduction of special topics such as preventive health, childcare and perhaps agriculture. Where possible, UNICEF should support the development of improved materials with workbooks for children and guides for teachers. This however is an extremely sensitive issue, and UNICEF may only be able to help, for example, with the development of health education materials and the like.

UNICEF should support first the training of master teacher trainers, or whom there are very, very few, and secondarily the training of teachers. Emphasis should probably be placed on training teachers inside Afghanistan, as opposed to continued training for refugee teachers. A considerable amount of training has already been provided to refugee teachers. This does not mean that all Afghan teachers in Pakistan have had training. They have not, but because there have not been evaluations to assess the impact of the training, it is not known if the teaching of those trained has improved substantially. There is also probably an overconcentration of the trainees from certain provinces, such as Nangarhar, Paktia, Konar and Kandahar. It is also difficult to determine now whether refugee teachers will want to continue teaching at home, where the salaries will be much lower. There may also be an insufficient number of jobs to employ these teachers at home, and some, who are under-qualified but have gained their appointments through political contacts, may not be acceptable as teachers at home.

In-service training is more of a priority, and is probably more cost-effective, than is pre-service training. One time training will not be sufficient. Follow-up on-site assistance over time